

## **RYA 2014/2**

(incorporating 2004/7)

[Rule 29.1, Recalls; Individual Recall](#)

[Rule 62.1, Redress](#)

[Race Signals, X](#)

*When the race committee intends an individual recall but, while displaying flag X, makes two sound signals in addition to the starting sound signal, this is an improper action. However, a boat that ceases racing before she can see which recall flag, if any, is displayed may be at fault and hence not entitled to redress.*

*A race committee signal comprises both the flag and the sound.*

### **SUMMARY OF THE FACTS**

In starting a race, the race committee made the starting signal with one sound signal and identified a boat as OCS. They then displayed flag X and made two further sound signals. Shortly afterwards, the OCS boat returned and flag X was removed.

### **QUESTION 1**

Was there an improper action by the race committee?

### **ANSWER 1**

Yes. Rule 29.1 specifies that the individual recall signal is the display of flag X with one sound signal. Having displayed flag X and made one sound signal, making a second sound signal was an improper action by the race committee.

### **ADDITIONAL FACTS FOR QUESTION 2**

Boat A, which was not OCS, believed there to have been a general recall and bore away back towards the starting line until she was able to see that it was flag X that was displayed. She then resumed racing.

Boat B, also having heard two sounds, turned back towards the starting line but was not able to see the flag during the short time that it was displayed. When she saw no flags displayed, she resumed her course to the first mark.

Both boats finished in worse positions as a result of turning back and requested redress on the grounds that they believed that a general recall had been signalled.

### **QUESTION 2**

Is either boat A or B entitled to redress?

### **ANSWER 2**

No, neither boat is entitled to redress.

There was an improper action of the race committee, but rule 62.1 states that a boat must satisfy two additional conditions to be granted redress.

Firstly, her score must be made worse; this condition is satisfied. Secondly, the worsening must be through no fault of her own.

A recall signal is the combination of the visual flag and the sound. It is only starting signals in accordance with rule 26 that are governed solely by the visual signal.

Both boats were at fault and lost places through relying solely on the sound element of the signal, and turning back when there was no need to do so before they could see the flag signal. Rule 29.2 states that a general recall signal is the display of the First Substitute with two sounds. As that flag was not displayed, no General Recall was signalled. Until the boats could see which flag was (or was not) being displayed, they should not have acted on the assumption from the two sound signals alone that there had been a general recall.

This is different from the situation, described in ISAF Case 31, where flag X is displayed but no sound signal is made. In that case, there was no reason for a boat to look for a recall flag and, by continuing to race, her score was affected through no fault of her own.

RYA 2014, based on:

Request for redress by *Chaotic*, Royal Yorkshire YC

Request for redress by Topper 45772, Largs SC