

Philippe Descola,

Professor of Anthropology at the Collège de France, Paris
Member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences
Member of the British Academy

25 February 2013

As a fellow anthropologist, also with a long trajectory in the study of Amazonian Indians, I fully agree with the assessment given by Viveiros de Castro of the work of Chagnon among the Yanomami. It is puzzling for European anthropologists that Chagnon has met with such huge success in the US (in terms of books sold at least), so crude is his thinking and so shallow his ethnography. I don't remember having seen any reference made to his work for a very long time in the anthropological literature on Amazonia. Professor Sahlins is, in my eyes and those of many other scholars the world over, the most respected anthropologist alive today, and I should think that the media and the general US public should pay attention to his courageous stand in this case.

Manuela Carneiro da Cunha

Professor emerita at the University of Chicago
Member of the Brazilian Academy of Sciences
Member of the Third World Academy of Sciences

25 February 2013

In 1988, as the then president of the Brazilian Anthropological Association, I sent a letter of protest to the American Anthropological Association about the work of Napoleon Chagnon and its political effects. As a member myself of the Brazilian Academy of Sciences and of the Third World Academy of Sciences, I was shocked by his recent election to the National Academy of Sciences, and particularly so since his influence on our profession is next to nil. Marshall Sahlins, in contrast, continues to be the most widely cited and most influential North American anthropologist in Brazil. That he should be portrayed as an enemy of science by Napoleon Chagnon, who in turn poses as its avenger is to have a very poor opinion of what science is. I applaud Sahlins's decision to resign from the NAS, which is consistent with his biography, that of a stellar anthropologist and a committed citizen, who has never hesitated in taking a stand in defense of justice both in politics and in sound anthropology.