# MINUTES OF THE MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS REGIONAL COUNCIL MEETING

July 25, 2012 MAG Office, Saguaro Room Phoenix, Arizona

#### MEMBERS ATTENDING

Mayor Marie Lopez Rogers, Avondale, Chair #Councilman Dennis Kavanaugh for Mayor Scott Smith, Mesa

- \* Councilwoman Robin Barker, Apache Junction Mayor Jackie Meck, Buckeye
- # Mayor David Schwan, Carefree Councilman Dick Esser, Cave Creek Mayor Jay Tibshraeny, Chandler
- \* Mayor Lana Mook, El Mirage
- \* President Clinton Pattea, Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation
- \* Mayor Linda Kavanagh, Fountain Hills
- \* Mayor Ron Henry, Gila Bend
- \* Governor Gregory Mendoza, Gila River Indian Community
  - Mayor John Lewis, Gilbert
- #Mayor Elaine Scruggs, Glendale Mayor Georgia Lord, Goodyear
- \* Mayor Yolanda Solarez, Guadalupe

Mayor Thomas Schoaf, Litchfield Park Supervisor Max W. Wilson, Maricopa Co.

- \*Mayor Scott LeMarr, Paradise Valley
- #Mayor Bob Barrett, Peoria
- \*Mayor Greg Stanton, Phoenix Mayor Gail Barney, Queen Creek
- \*President Diane Enos, Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community Mayor W. J. "Jim" Lane, Scottsdale Mayor Sharon Wolcott, Surprise Mayor Mark Mitchell, Tempe
- \*Mayor Adolfo Gamez, Tolleson
- \*Councilman Rui Pereira, Wickenburg #Mayor Michael LeVault, Youngtown
- \*Victor Flores, State Transportation Board
- \*Joseph La Rue, State Transportation Board
- #Roc Arnett, Citizens Transportation Oversight
  Committee
- \* Those members neither present nor represented by proxy.
- # Attended by telephone conference call.
- + Attended by videoconference

#### 1. Call to Order

The meeting of the MAG Regional Council was called to order by Chair Marie Lopez Rogers at 11:35 a.m.

#### 2. Pledge of Allegiance

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Mr. Roc Arnett, Mayor Bob Barrett, Mayor Michael LeVault, Mayor Lana Mook, Mayor David Schwan, Mayor Elaine Scruggs, and Councilman Dennis Kavanaugh, as proxy for Mayor Scott Smith, joined the meeting via teleconference.

Chair Rogers introduced a new member to the Regional Council, Mayor Mark Mitchell from the City of Tempe. She presented Mayor Mitchell with his Regional Council membership certificate.

Chair Rogers requested that members of the public who would like to comment fill out a blue public comment card for the Call to the Audience agenda item or a yellow public comment card for Consent Agenda items, or items on the agenda for action. Transit tickets for those who used transit to attend the meeting and parking validation were available from staff.

#### 3. Call to the Audience

Chair Rogers noted that the Call to the Audience provides an opportunity to members of the audience who wish to speak on items not scheduled on the agenda that fall under the jurisdiction of MAG, or on items on the agenda for discussion but not for action. Citizens are requested to not exceed a three minute time period for their comments. A total of 15 minutes is provided for the Call to the Audience agenda item, unless the Regional Council requests an exception to this limit. Those wishing to comment on agenda items posted for action will be provided the opportunity at the time the item is heard.

Chair Rogers recognized public comment from Joseph Ryan, who said he has been a resident of Sun City West for 20 years and has been commenting on transportation in this region. Mr. Ryan stated that all of the express buses go to government buildings and the trunk lines are 12 miles apart, Loop 101 and I-10. He said that they are now putting the rapid transit trunk line on top of that, instead of at the halfway point. Mr. Ryan spoke about connections to arterials that feed onto I-17 that are backed up. Mr. Ryan stated that there were trolley lines all over Philadelphia when he was growing up, but you will not find a single one any more because they are slow, dangerous, and cost people time. He said an elevated system with prefabricated pylons is preferable and can be installed faster. Chair Rogers thanked Mr. Ryan for his comments.

Chair Rogers recognized public comment from Dianne Barker, a resident of Phoenix, who said she had come to the meeting by bus and light rail. She expressed her appreciation for receiving a transit ticket and remarked how parking is reimbursed at many places but not transit costs, and this makes her feel like a second-class citizen. Ms. Barker stated that she believed that MAG is multimodal and that we need a balanced transportation system. She stated that it seems cars are protected more than people. Ms. Barker recollected when the trolley was removed in Ohio in favor of cars, but in Chicago, she found out that she would be penalized for driving a car. She said that express buses are more competitive than cars but that is not advertised. Ms. Barker said that she used to do a cartwheel to show how a multimodal lifestyle keeps her in shape. Ms. Barker then read the Ten Steps to Improve Air Quality. She also encouraged recycling and moving this region toward being a leader in multimodalism in the world. Chair Rogers thanked Ms. Barker for her comments.

Chair Rogers recognized John Rusinek, a resident of Phoenix, who spoke about dust proofing. He said that the driveway of the home next door to his has never been dust proofed and he turned in a complaint more than seven years ago. Mr. Rusinek stated that he came to a MAG meeting and since then, he has found out that there is no non-conformity provision at the City of Phoenix for grandfathering older residences from dust proofing of driving or maneuvering surfaces. He spoke about a polymer coating they were applying but are now putting in two inches of gravel which is supposed to be three inches. Mr. Rusinek stated that the City of Phoenix told him they will not make the neighbor dust proof the right of way that is 13 feet from the street and it doesn't make sense to drive 13 feet on a non-dust-proofed surface onto a dust-proofed surface. Mr. Rusinek commented that all other houses in the neighborhood have granite or concrete driveways except the one next door to him. Chair Rogers thanked Mr. Rusinek for his comments.

Mayor Tibshraeny stated that after the last time Mr. Rusinek spoke at MAG, Mayor Tibshraeny had asked that the City of Phoenix follow up with the citizen and provide him the status. Mr. Smith replied that MAG had contacted the City of Phoenix and that is why action was being taken. Mayor Tibshraeny encouraged pursuing that.

Chair Rogers recognized public comment from Joseph "Pat" Vint, who has been a resident of the Valley for 60 years since he got off the plane at Luke Air Force Base from Korea. He said he is semi-retired, but was in business for 56 years. Mr. Vint stated that Mayor Stanton was not at the meeting that day but he has been on vacation since he became mayor. He stated that the City of Phoenix is a disaster in progress and has been since Paul Johnson was appointed mayor 30 years ago and Frank Fairbanks became City Manager. Mr. Vint stated that he was friends with Mr. Fairbanks until he retired, taking \$300,000 per month for one year and now he gets a quarter of a million dollars for retirement. Mr. Vint stated that he added a restaurant to his shopping center at 13<sup>th</sup> Street and Northern, after consulting with engineers and architects. Three months after it opened, the City said he had built it in the street and they sent the Gestapo from Neighborhood Services to tell him to tear it down. Mr. Vint stated that he was fortunate to meet a lawyer, and he said there is a difference between a lawyer and an attorney — an attorney will turn on you. Chair Rogers thanked Mr. Vint for his comments.

#### 4. Executive Director's Report

Dennis Smith, MAG Executive Director, reported on items of interest in the MAG region. He stated that the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has issued a finding of completeness for the MAG 2012 Five Percent Plan for PM-10. He noted that the Finding of Completeness stops the related clocks for mandatory sanctions under the Clean Air Act. Mr. Smith stated that the next step is approval by the EPA to avoid the implementation of a federal plan.

Mr. Smith stated that Chair Rogers will be the moderator of a panel at the League of Arizona Cities and Towns Annual Conference on August 29, 2012. The topic of discussion will be *Mexico – Arizona's #1 Trading Partner*. Mr. Smith noted that other panelists will be Walter P. Bastain, Deputy Assistant Secretary for the Western Hemisphere for the U.S. Department of Commerce, International Trade Administration; Margie Emmermann, Executive Director of the Arizona Mexico Commission; Mayor

Arturo R. Garino, City of Nogales; John Halikowski, Director of the Arizona Department of Transportation, and Mayor Greg Stanton, City of Phoenix.

Mr. Smith stated that the U.S. Department of Commerce National Conference on border economic issues will take place on September 23-25, 2012, at the Fiesta Inn in Tempe. He said that the conference will be hosted by the ASU North American Center of Transborder Studies and the U.S. Department of Commerce International Trade Administration. Mr. Smith stated that MAG members are invited to attend. Mr. Smith stated that Michael Camuñez, U.S. Assistant Secretary of Commerce for Market Access and Compliance, has agreed to stay a day after the Department of Commerce conference in order to attend a session with the partners who signed the Arizona Border Resolution. Mr. Smith noted that the session will be September 26, the same day as the Regional Council meeting, and detailed information will follow later.

Mr. Smith displayed the March 2010 map that showed more than 63,000 foreclosed and pending foreclosed homes. He then showed the map updated in June 2012 that showed a little more than 21,000 foreclosed and pending foreclosed homes, a significant improvement from 63,000.

Mr. Smith stated that MAG's Municipal Aging Services Project was submitted to the White House Office of Public Engagement and the Office of Social Innovation and Civic Participation. He said that the goal is to showcase new partnerships or technologies that are solving old problems. Mr. Smith noted that the project would participate in an August 27, 2012, event if selected, and would provide a great opportunity to showcase the need to rethink senior centers. Mr. Smith noted that 70 percent of Baby Boomers are not going to senior centers, even though the infrastructure is there. He added that it is important to have facilities and support systems in place when people leave hospitals to keep the readmittance rate down. Mr. Smith noted that MAG staff, Amy St. Peter, is the contact for this project.

Chair Rogers thanked Mr. Smith for his report. No questions for Mr. Smith were noted.

#### 5. Approval of Consent Agenda

Chair Rogers noted that agenda items #5A, #5B, #5C, #5D, #5E, #5F, #5G, and #5H were on the Consent Agenda.

Chair Rogers recognized public comment from Mr. Ryan, who said there should be a review of how people do business in this region. He added that he had printed out 173 pages from the Internet. Mr. Ryan referenced page 9 of 12 where appears a request for more money for the Central Mesa light rail project by METRO. Mr. Ryan stated that the request is for \$9.784 million, an increase of 73 percent from the original contract. He noted that he has seen some situations where people bid low, get the job, and then raise the price. Mr. Ryan stated that spare parts is another investment and he commented on the many different companies that are manufacturing trolleys for this region. He said that it violates all the principles of making a system. Having a shortage of money to buy spare parts and cross train people is creating a very dangerous situation. Mr. Ryan commented how they have elevated rail in New York City with four lines: two local and two express. Chair Rogers thanked Mr. Ryan for his comments.

Chair Rogers recognized public comment from Ms. Barker, who expressed support for Mr. Ryan's comments. She noted he has a transportation background running an airline in Ethiopia. Ms. Barker asked to combine her comments for agenda item #6 with her comments on the consent agenda. She stated that she did not support MAG's trip plan. She said that the model MAG uses is not up to date. Ms. Barker stated that the City of Phoenix bought 11 acres to put their employees and she thought they were going to try to prove numbers to the federal government in order to get funding for the train. She noted there is pollution underground. Ms. Barker stated that she went to ADEQ and found there is a huge plume from Honeywell to the north runway and they have changed storage tanks. She stated that the air quality monitor is three miles away from Sky Harbor Airport. Ms. Barker stated that the administration of transportation needs improvement. She stated that multimodal is needed at the Broadway curve, not more traffic lanes. She stated that what we have been doing will not work in the future. Chair Rogers thanked Ms. Barker for her comments.

Chair Rogers asked members if they had questions or requests to hear a consent agenda item individually. None were noted.

Mayor Tibshraeny moved to approve the Consent Agenda. Mayor Barney seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

### 5A. Approval of the June 27, 2012, Meeting Minutes

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the June 27, 2012, meeting minutes.

## 5B. <u>Project Changes – Amendment and Administrative Modification to the FY 2011-2015 MAG</u> Transportation Improvement Program and to the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update; and necessary project funding modifications related to approved federal fiscal year 2012 Closeout projects, based on the forthcoming final apportionment tables from Federal Highway Administration and Federal Transit Administration. The Fiscal Year (FY) 2011-2015 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) 2010 Update were approved by the MAG Regional Council on July 28, 2010, and have been modified seventeen times, with the latest approval on June 27, 2012. Since then, there is a need to modify projects in the programs. The requested project changes include freeway, highway, highway safety, light rail, roadway, transportation enhancement, transit, paving, pedestrian, transportation improvements, and bridge projects. Due to requested changes in the Freeway Lifecycle Program, Arterial Lifecycle Program, and Transit Lifecycle Program some included projects are dependent on a new finding of conformity. A new finding of conformity for the projects in Table A, B, C, and D, were heard through the MAG Committee process as a separate agenda item beginning at MAG Management Committee. The Arterial Lifecycle Program requested changes are work year/work phase related and will be incorporated into an update of the Arterial Lifecycle Program. The Arterial Lifecycle Program will be rebalanced and is expected to be presented to committees in September. On July 11, 2012, the MAG Management Committee recommended approval of the requested changes. The Federal Highway Administration and Federal Transit Administration are currently developing the final funding amounts for federal fiscal year (FFY) 2012 due to the passage of the new transportation authorization bill. Based on the federal funding amounts directed to the MAG region, modifications to funding amounts to previously approved FFY 2012 Closeout projects will be needed. On July 18, 2012, the Transportation Policy Committee recommended approval of amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update; and necessary project funding modifications related to approved federal fiscal year 2012 Closeout projects, based on the forthcoming final apportionment tables from Federal Highway Administration and Federal Transit Administration.

### 5C. MAG Federally Funded Locally Sponsored Projects Development Status Report

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved federal fund projects to be deferred, deleted, and changed and of the necessary amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update. The MAG Federal Fund Programming Guidelines & Procedures, approved by the MAG Regional Council on October 26, 2011, outline the requirements for local agencies to submit status information on the development of their federal funded projects. This Project Development Status Report focuses mainly on projects funded with Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) funds that are programmed to obligate in Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2012, 2013, and 2014. The Project Development Status workbook that was sent to member agencies required that a project development schedule was completed and project changes could be requested. Based on information submitted by local agencies, information was cross checked with the ADOT Local Government section for feasibility, and further inquiries were made by MAG staff. The Project Development Status Report identifies the projects programmed to obligate in FFY 2013 and 2014 that are requesting a deferral to a later year or to be deleted or have funds reprogrammed, and the projects that are projected to obligate based on the schedule submitted. The Project Development Status Report also is a final inventory for ADOT, of the projects programmed to obligate in FFY 2012. If approved, this action will allow projects to proceed, and will complete Tier 1 of the Dynamic TIP Programming process that is included in the MAG Federal Fund Programming Guidelines & Procedures. The federal fund projects to be deferred, deleted, and changed and of the necessary amendments and administrative modifications to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program, and as appropriate, to the Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update, were recommended for approval by the Transportation Review Committee on June 28, 2012, the MAG Management Committee on July 11, 2012, and the Transportation Policy Committee on July 18, 2012.

# 5D. <u>Status of Remaining MAG Approved PM-10 Certified Street Sweeper Projects That Have Not Requested Reimbursement</u>

A status report is being provided on the remaining PM-10 certified street sweeper projects that have received approval, but have not requested reimbursement. To assist MAG in reducing the amount of obligated federal funds carried forward in the MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget, MAG is requesting that street sweepers be purchased and reimbursement be requested by the agency within one year plus ten calendar days from the date of the MAG authorization letter.

# 5E. New Finding of Conformity for the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update, As Amended

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the new Finding of Conformity for the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program and Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update, as amended. On July 28, 2010, the MAG Regional Council approved a Finding of Conformity for the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and MAG Regional Transportation Plan 2010 Update. Since that time, an amendment was proposed that includes project modifications resulting from the MAG Regional Freeway and Highway Life Cycle Program 2012 rebalancing, the Arterial Life Cycle Program, the advancement of the Northwest Light Rail Extension transit project, and other various projects. MAG has conducted a regional emissions analysis for the proposed amendment and the results of the regional emissions analysis, when considered together with the TIP and RTP as a whole, indicate that the transportation projects will not contribute to violations of federal air quality standards. On June 8, 2012, a 30-day public review period began on the conformity assessment and amendment. On July 11, 2012, the MAG Management Committee recommended approval.

#### 5F. Conformity Consultation

The Maricopa Association of Governments is conducting consultation on a conformity assessment for an amendment and administrative modification to the FY 2011-2015 MAG Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). The amendment and administrative modification involve several projects, including new Arizona Department of Transportation projects and changes to Arterial Life Cycle Program projects. The amendment includes projects that may be categorized as exempt from conformity determinations. The administrative modification includes minor project revisions that do not require a conformity determination. Comments were requested by July 20, 2012.

### 5G. 2012 Heat Relief Network

The Maricopa Association of Governments has developed two maps to help make water and refuge available to vulnerable populations during the hot summer months. This activity supports regional heat relief activities. The hydration and refuge map shows where water hydration stations and refuge locations are located throughout the county, or where people in need can go for water and refuge locations. The donation map shows water collection and donation sites throughout the region. Many heat-relief efforts have been implemented over the past seven years to prevent people from dying from heat-related illnesses. This item was presented to alert member agencies to resources available throughout the summer months and to solicit assistance in making these resources available. The maps are being distributed throughout the community, available on the MAG website at <a href="www.azmag.gov">www.azmag.gov</a> and provided to staff at the CONTACS shelter (hotline: 602-263-8900). CONTACS will send outreach teams to people reported as being in need of assistance. These efforts began in 2005 when record numbers of homeless people died as a result of the heat. The number of sites offering assistance has doubled since these efforts began. This year, there are 89 hydration, refuge locations, and donation sites across the region, a record number for the network. The maps are updated throughout the summer as additional partners join the network.

#### 5H. Appointments of the MAG Economic Development Committee Member Agency Positions

The MAG Regional Council, by consent, approved the appointments of the Economic Development Committee (EDC) member agency positions. On October 27, 2010, the MAG Regional Council approved the composition of the MAG Economic Development Committee (EDC). The composition includes twelve MAG member agency positions that have one-year terms with possible reappointment by recommendation of the Executive Committee and approval of the MAG Regional Council. Due to the prescribed seats, such as the Transportation Policy Committee Chair and Vice Chair in June each year, appointments of the EDC member agency positions will occur annually at the July MAG Regional Council meeting. On June 28, 2012, a memorandum was sent to the MAG Regional Council members soliciting nominations for the member agency positions on the EDC. On July 16, 2012, the MAG Executive Committee recommended the appointments to the EDC member agency positions.

#### 8. Arizona Mexico Commission Update

This agenda item was taken out of order.

Chair Rogers stated that the Arizona Mexico Commission held its 2012 Summer Plenary Session in June 2012 in Tucson. She noted that Arizona Governor Janice Brewer and Sonora Governor Guillermo Padres attended the conference, which had a significant attendance.

Margie Emmermann, Executive Director of the Arizona Mexico Commission and the Governor's Policy Adviser for Mexico, spoke to the Regional Council about the Commission and the Plenary Session. She noted that the Arizona Mexico Commission was established 53 years ago by Governor Fannin of Arizona and Governor Obregon of Sonora, Mexico, with the simple motto of: "God made us neighbors; let us be good neighbors." Ms. Emmermann stated that the Commission is a 501(c)4 chaired by the Governor of Arizona. She stated that the Commission has a gubernatorial appointed board, currently 22 members, and has 15 committees working on a variety of topics that are pertinent to the bilateral relationship. Ms. Emmermann stated that they want to keep their members informed, advocate on issues important to the grassroots of the organization, and ensure business happens. She said they have a broad variety of partners they bring into the equation.

Ms. Emmermann stated that Governor Brewer chairs the organization on the Arizona side and Governor Padres of Sonora chairs the commission on the Mexican side. She noted that having a good working relationship between Arizona and Mexico is critical. Ms. Emmermann stated that over the years the Commission has prided itself on addressing topics that drive relationships and the quality of life for citizens. Over the years, the Commission has looked at economic development, education, air quality, and health services to identify goals. Ms. Emmermann noted that one of the most important topics is Vision 2015, to identify from a port of entry perspective, the needs and prioritizing them, gaining recognition from the border mayors, and advocating with the federal government. She noted that MAG has been instrumental in working with the Commission on the dialogue of port infrastructure.

Ms. Emmermann stated that they meet twice per year and at their plenary sessions they identify the most important topic of the moment and build their agendas around what is critical need. She stated that at

the February plenary session, corridor development was an important topic, with the Mariposa entry coming online and additional work being done in San Luis. Ms. Emmermann stated that MAG has undertaken a great effort to improve the understanding of the importance of bilateral trade and what it will take to keep our economy moving and competitive in this global economy. She noted that at the session, they also received updates on what is occurring on the Mexican side. Ms. Emmermann stated there are opportunities, but also threats to be cognizant of. She said that the Governor announced the formation of the Transportation & Trade Corridor Alliance at this session.

Ms. Emmermann stated that the focus was broad-based at this summer's three-day plenary session, attended by more than 600 people. She said they partnered with the federal government and discussed the binational bridges and border crossings. Ms. Emmermann stated that both US and Mexican governments discussed this topic with elected officials, snf this led into a real estate summit that offered education credits, and work on the Arizona/Sonora Master Planning effort. Ms. Emmermann stated that because they had assembled so many regional players, they had a trade and transportation logistics forum.

Ms. Emmermann said that the three key topics at the plenary session this year were energy, aerospace and defense, and mining. She said that the first day was an energy summit where three state-of-the-art demonstration projects were toured. Ms. Emmermann explained that Mexico is currently going through deregulation of energy that could create opportunities for potential interconnection of grids and US investment in Mexico. She remarked that the University of Arizona solar zone was quite impressive. Ms. Emmermann stated that a task force of five Arizona representatives and five Sonora representatives has been formed to identify opportunities with energy.

Ms. Emmermann stated that Governor Brewer and Governor Padres brought key aerospace and defense industry leaders to a roundtable discussion. She said that one important point is where to add value in job creation and economic development. Ms. Emmermann stated that with nearshoring opportunities, this discussion was about bringing those jobs back into northern Mexico, and come into Sonora, which would benefit Arizona more. Ms. Emmermann stated that six critical factors were identified in this discussion.

Ms. Emmerman stated that most importantly, the Commission is about interacting and building relationships, and nurturing grassroots dialogue going up to agency directors and the Governor. It is not just about meetings but bringing people together and allowing them to network and build friendships. She said that the most important thing of a bilateral relationship is wanting to be a community and wanting to work together. Ms. Emmermann expressed her appreciation to Chair Rogers and MAG for taking advantage of partnering opportunities. She added that the next plenary session will take place in the Fall.

Chair Rogers thanked Ms. Emmermann for her presentation and stated that she looked forward to supporting the efforts of the Commission. She asked if there were any questions.

Mayor Lane referenced the deregulation of the energy industry. He mentioned the new administration in Mexico and asked Ms. Emmermann for clarification when she spoke about the deregulation of an

industry that is nationalized she meant there would be some element of denationalization of the energy industry. Ms. Emmermann replied that the deregulation that will allow the grid to interconnect has already happened. She advised that the US and Mexican grids are not compatible and the White Paper will be looking at that and other opportunities for American investors that the current Mexican law allows.

Mayor Lane asked for clarification that deregulation meant the laws of international connectivity between the grids changed. Ms. Emmermann replied yes. She stated that the overall energy industry does allow some investment that was not allowed in the past. Ms. Emmermann added that this does not mean it is totally open, but there are pockets of opportunity for private enterprise for US residents and Mexico nationals in Mexico and the White Paper will help people understand what is allowed and not allowed under Mexican law.

Mayor Lane asked for clarification that the industry was still federally owned. Ms. Emmermann replied yes, and she added that many people are looking forward to seeing what the new president of Mexico will be doing in terms of renewable energy and the federally owned electrical industry. She saidthe task force will be looking at the opportunities that might become available as he takes office.

Chair Rogers thanked Ms. Emmermann for taking time to present at the meeting.

#### 9. Arizona Transportation & Trade Corridor Alliance Update

Gail Lewis, Director of the Office of P3 Initiatives and International Affairs of the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT), reported on the Arizona Transportation & Trade Corridor Alliance. She stated that the formation of the Alliance was announced by Governor Brewer at the February plenary session mentioned in the previous presentation by Ms. Emmermann. Ms. Lewis stated that the Alliance is led by ADOT, but is a cooperative venture of ADOT, the Arizona Mexico Commission and Arizona Commerce Authority.

Ms. Lewis provided background that led to the formation of the Alliance. She stated that the nation's gas tax has remained flat for 20 years and revenues are now at 1994 levels. The state is moving from spending 75 percent of its budget on construction toward spending 65 percent on maintenance (the amount for new projects will shrink). Public/private partnerships and other alternative financing means and communicating these facts to the public and business leaders are imperative. Ms. Lewis noted that the Governor wanted to ensure a linkage with the private sector on transportation and trade.

Ms. Lewis stated that globalization and trade may be the defining trends in the current economy. She noted that jobs connected to trade and international activity pay about 16 percent higher than other jobs. Trade connects to foreign investment, stabilizes markets, evens out the economy, and exports bring in new money. Ms. Lewis stated that trade and manufacturing jobs tend to cluster near transportation hubs and airports, or vice versa.

Ms. Lewis stated that companies want reliable, seamless, and cost efficient transportation and infrastructure systems to move their goods as quickly as possible.

Ms. Lewis then spoke of recent trends that can help in understanding trade and transportation and interaction with the private sector. She said that according to a CoreNet survey almost all companies who ship goods use trucks. Ms. Lewis stated that E-commerce has significant policy implications, will require warehousing and shipping, and put more stress on the transportation system. She stated that there are competing public and private sector philosophies: people feel their taxes are too high, but the gas tax has not been increased since 1994. Ms. Lewis stated that infrastructure, although it is in fairly good condition locally, is deteriorating nationally. She noted that there are also new trends such as nearshoring. Ms. Lewis noted that the recent White Paper done by the Thunderbird School of Global Management on behalf of MAG, examined this trend to bring manufacturing jobs closer to the United States. She said that nearshoring could open up opportunities with Mexico and increase the importance of a north-south corridor between Mexico and the United States.

Ms. Lewis stated that the Alliance was formed because it was felt that increased interaction between commerce and transportation with the private sector was needed. She said that the Alliance is not a Governor-appointed board, and members are invited by the agencies to serve in an informal advisory capacity. Ms. Lewis stated that the goal was to have a flexible forum for information and interaction and to help the state develop strategies for improving infrastructure and attracting private business.

Ms. Lewis stated that the Alliance is heavily private sector and includes representatives from APL, Avnet, UPS, BNSF, W. L. Gore, port authorities, growers and brokers, Mexican manufacturers, Arizona Trucking Association, Sky Harbor Airport, and several of the state's councils of governments and metropolitan planning organizations. Ms. Lewis stated that the steering committee will be co-chaired by former Congressman Jim Kolbe and ADOT Director John Halikowski. The Vice Chairs will be Margie Emmermann and Sandra Watson. Ms. Lewis stated that there will also be a larger, statewide stakeholder group, and they envision communicating via e-communications and having summits and small group meetings around the state.

Ms. Lewis stated that the new federal transportation legislation, Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century (MAP-21), has an entire section on freight, which has never happened in a federal act before. She said that it requires that state departments of transportation develop a freight plan and suggests that each state have a freight advisory committee. Ms. Lewis stated that the Alliance fills the federal requirements, which give the Alliance a set of substantive responsibilities.

Ms. Lewis summarized some facts: Six million US jobs are tied to Mexico; Mexico is the number one trading partner for six US states and number three for the nation; Mexico is the largest source of imported fruits and vegetables; the wage difference between Mexico and China is now less than 20 percent; for every \$1 spent on Mexican imports, Mexico spends more than 50 cents on US products, which is very different from the trade relationship with China.

Chair Rogers thanked Ms. Lewis for the report and asked if there were questions.

Mayor Lewis stated that an ADOT representative serves on the MAG Economic Development Committee. He asked if the same representative was on the Alliance in order to preserve that synergy. Mr. Smith replied that Sandra Watson serves on both the Alliance and the EDC. Ms. Lewis noted that

Floyd Roehrich is the ADOT representative on the MAG EDC and John Halikowski is the representative on the Alliance, and Mr. Roehrich is very involved with planning and policy. Mayor Lewis asked that feedback from the Alliance come to the EDC.

#### 6. Phoenix West Extension Locally Preferred Alternative Report Recommendations

Eileen Yazzie, MAG staff, provided a report on the Phoenix West Extension Locally Preferred Alternative Report Recommendations. She stated that METRO, in partnership with the City of Phoenix and the Federal Transit Administration (FTA), initiated a study in May 2007 to analyze potential high-capacity transit (HCT) improvements in the west Phoenix area. As part of the process to request funding from the FTA, the project underwent an alternatives analysis (AA) where several modes and alignments were evaluated to address the project's purpose and need and to define the Locally Preferred Alternative (LPA).

Ms. Yazzie noted that the requested motion was a three part process. She said that the Tempe LPA for the modern streetcar was a five-part process and the Mesa Light Rail extension was a three-part process. She explained that this is the final step in the approval process for the Phoenix West extension. Ms. Yazzie displayed a map of the study area and noted that it was broken down into two different areas: mainline and downtown.

Ms. Yazzie stated that the alternatives analysis process for the Phoenix West extension started five years ago. Ms. Yazzie stated that the study documents are available on the MAG web page.

Ms. Yazzie reviewed approvals to date: Recommendations for high capacity transit improvements in the Interstate 10 right-of-way west of Interstate 17 - Phoenix City Council, April 2008; METRO Board, June 2008; MAG Regional Council, July 2008. Recommendations for acceptance for the Alternatives Analysis Locally Preferred Alternative - Phoenix City Council, May 15, 2012, and the METRO Board, May 17, 2012. She noted that the Transportation Policy Committee recommended acceptance on July 18, 2012.

Ms. Yazzie then described the Phoenix West extension study area, which is bounded on the north by Thomas Road, on the south by Buckeye Road, on the west by Loop 101, and on the east by 7<sup>th</sup> Street. For the purposes of alternatives development and analysis, the corridor was divided into two sections: the mainline and downtown alignments. Ms. Yazzie noted that there was extensive community involvement and input in the development of the recommended route, especially by the St. Matthew's neighborhood. She stated that hundreds of people attended City of Phoenix and METRO stakeholder meetings. Ms. Yazzie stated that community leaders spoke at the METRO Board meeting when the alignment was approved, and indicated they were pleased with the alignment. Ms. Yazzie then noted that the recommended alignment will utilize the western frontage road of Interstate 17. She stated that the light rail passes by the state capitol complex.

Ms. Yazzie stated that light rail transit and bus rapid transit technologies were studied. She advised that over the duration, light rail has lower costs. Ms. Yazzie stated that the number of 2030 daily boardings for light rail is projected at almost 33,000, for bus rapid transit it is 9,200; the hourly capacity one-way

of light rail is 5,000 and bus rapid transit is 1,000; the travel time for light rail is 19 minutes and for bus rapid transit is 26 minutes.

Ms. Yazzie reviewed the funding sources for capital costs, which include the Public Transportation Fund, the City of Phoenix Transit 2000 tax, Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement funds, and FTA Section 5309 New Starts funds.

Ms. Yazzie stated that the opening year (2023) annual operating cost for the Phoenix West extension LRT project from 79<sup>th</sup> Avenue to downtown Phoenix is projected at \$17 million and from 79<sup>th</sup> Avenue to 19th Avenue/Dunlap is projected at \$29.3 million.

Ms. Yazzie stated that four elements along this corridor, called corridor advanced transit opportunities, will be built as a part of this light rail project. She noted that the elements include adding HOV ramps, expanding the 79<sup>th</sup> Avenue park and ride lot, adding a park and ride lot at 59<sup>th</sup> Avenue, and building a direct access ramp to the Interstate 17 southbound frontage road. Ms. Yazzie noted that these improvements will provide better transit times for bus riders in the West Valley. She added that if any opportunities for funding arise, any of these four projects could be done in advance of light rail and be of benefit to the region.

Chair Rogers thanked Ms. Yazzie for her report.

Chair Rogers recognized public comment from Mr. Ryan, who stated that Ethiopian Airlines has 6,000 employees who are cross-trained to perform all the airline jobs. He suggested that Mexican companies be shared companies. Mr. Ryan stated that a company such as the Bank of America cannot have a foreign currency account in Mexico. He stated that the United States has the opportunity to be manufacturing high capacity transit vehicles. Mr. Ryan noted page 28 of the report and said light rail runs every 35 minutes during off peak and peak times. He encouraged scheduling light rail to run more often during peak times and suggested that the people who wrote this need retraining.

Chair Rogers thanked Mr. Ryan for his comments. She requested that Mr. Smith have staff interact with Mr. Ryan about his concerns. Mr. Smith noted that MAG would get with METRO staff about speaking with Mr. Ryan.

Chair Rogers asked members if they had questions for Ms. Yazzie or Mr. Callow.

Mayor Lewis asked the opinion of the West Valley communities about the light rail alignment. Chair Rogers noted that the alignment is not extending to any of the West Valley cities right now, but they look forward to connecting to bus rapid transit or light rail in the West Valley in the future. She noted that currently, there are long range regional transit framework studies underway.

Mayor Wolcott stated that the studies underway are attempting to take a long range look in the southwest and northwest sections of the region. She remarked that ultimately, it is about being connected. Mayor Wolcott stated that the fact that light rail is extending farther west is encouraging, but are we going to be truly multimodal, which she felt was key to a successful transit system. Mayor Wolcott stated that

we need to think about the appropriate placement of modes in different corridors and the farther west you go, you will see a sensitivity toward having transit that is rapid. Mayor Wolcott stated that we cannot rely on a slow mode of travel that will move a lot of people a couple of blocks, but rather move people in from the outskirts in a rapid fashion. She said they want to ensure connectivity to a system that gets people where they want to go quickly.

Mayor Lane stated that even though his community is not one impacted by this project, he would like to mention a number of things that were discussed at length at the Transportation Policy Committee meeting. Mayor Lane stated that the project will utilize existing right-of-way, and eliminating that cost is a huge benefit to the program. He stated that the project will not eliminate any traffic lanes on the streets or highway. Mayor Lane stated that these components are huge in the sense of utilization and application. He stated that this project is almost a cross between light rail and commuter rail since the alignment is along a true transportation corridor outside of city streets. Mayor Lane stated that it also relieves a traffic situation. He stated that with I-10, he thought it provided a huge benefit to provide fast and convenient transportation along the route and potentially reduce vehicular traffic. Mayor Lane remarked that he felt this application was as good as it gets.

Supervisor Wilson thanked Mayor Lane for his comments. He expressed that he would not want to miss an opportunity to provide a solution to traffic in the West Valley. Supervisor Wilson stated that he commutes every day on the west side and would like to see traffic improve. He encouraged not passing up this opportunity.

With no further discussion, Mayor Mitchell moved acceptance of the Phoenix West Alternatives Analysis for (1) A Locally Preferred Alternative (LPA) for the Phoenix West project, including a light rail alignment along I-10 from 79th Avenue to I-17; southbound along I-17 southbound frontage road; east along Van Buren Street to 18th Avenue; southbound along 18th Avenue to Jefferson Street and then east to downtown Phoenix along Jefferson Street; (2) Inclusion of the Corridor Advanced Transit Opportunities (CATO) Program that consists of near term improvements and investments to improve existing mobility, enhance transit service and lay the groundwork for future high capacity transit (HCT) service within the study area. The set of proposed projects includes: construction of a direct HCT access ramp from I-10 to I-17, expansion of the 79th Avenue Park-and-Ride, identification and development of new park and ride stations, and construction of direct connection I-10 HOV ramps on the west side of 79th Avenue; and (3) Future consideration for increased transit service for areas within and west of the study area, per the long range transit needs identified in MAG's Regional Transit Framework Study, through the regional transportation system planning process. Supervisor Wilson seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 7. Report on the City of Phoenix "Buy Local First" Policy

Due to time constraints, this agenda item was not heard. Chair Rogers noted that it would be scheduled for the next meeting.

10.	Legis	lative	Una	late
10.	Legis	ianvc	$\circ$	aaic

This agenda item was not heard.

#### 11. Request for Future Agenda Items

Topics or issues of interest that the Regional Council would like to have considered for discussion at a future meeting were requested.

No requests were noted.

#### 12. Comments from the Council

An opportunity was provided for Regional Council members to present a brief summary of current events. The Regional Council is not allowed to propose, discuss, deliberate or take action at the meeting on any matter in the summary, unless the specific matter is properly noticed for legal action.

Mayor Wolcott stated that she had sent out an invitation to the First Annual Mayor's Bowling Challenge. She said that this is an opportunity to get together and get to know each other. She encouraged each mayor to assemble a team and contact her office with their names.

#### Adjournment

There being no further business, Mayor Schoaf moved and Mayor Meck seconded the motion to adjourn the meeting at 1:05 p.m.

	Chair
Secretary	_