Comments on: Economic Impacts of Global Terrorism: From Munich to Bali

(by James Barth, Tong Li, Don McCarthy, Triphon Phumiwasana & Glenn Yago)

Justin Wolfers Wharton School, U.Penn CEPR, IZA & NBER

AEA Meetings

Sunday January 8, 2006

Research Question

• What are the economic impacts of terrorism?

- Language: "Economic jihad"
- $-\operatorname{Outcome}_{c,t} = \operatorname{Terrorism}_{c,t} + \operatorname{Controls}_{c,t} + \operatorname{Country}_{c} + \operatorname{Year}_{t}$

• Outcome variables:

- Growth in real GDP per capita ($\Delta Y/n$)
- Capital formation to GDP (I/Y)
- Stock market capitalization to GDP
- Stock traded value to GDP
- ♦ Which of these variables are:
 - Interesting?
 - Welfare-relevant?
 - Sensible?

- Terrorism variables:
 - Incidents per capita
 - Incidents per GDP
 - Fatalities & injuries per capita
 - Fatalities & injuries per GDP
 - Terrorist incidents per capita
 - (Business targets)

Justin Wolfers, Comments on "Economic Impacts of Terrorism"

Research Question

What are the economic impacts of terrorism?
– Language: "Economic jihad"

 $-\text{Outcome}_{c,t} = \text{Terrorism}_{c,t} + \text{Controls}_{c,t} + \text{Country}_{c} + \text{Year}_{t}$

• Outcome variables:

- Growth in real GDP per capita ($\Delta Y/n$)
- Capital formation to GDP (I/Y)
- Stock market capitalization to GDP
- Stock traded value to GDP
 - ♦ Which are:
 - Interesting?
 - Welfare-relevant?
 - Sensible?

- Terrorism variables:
 - Incidents per capita
 - Incidents per GDP
 - Fatalities & injuries per capita
 - Fatalities & injuries per GDP
 - Terrorist incidents per capita (Business targets)

Justin Wolfers, Comments on "Economic Impacts of Terrorism"

Author's Answers

	Effects of a 1 standard deviation shock to terrorism on:		Effects of September 11 on:	
	$\Delta(Y/n)$	I/Y	$\Delta(Y/n)$	I/Y
Incidents per	-0.11%	0126	-0.0003%	000006
capita	(p=.06)	(p=.011)	(p=.06)	(p=.011)
Fatalities &	-0.002%	-0.005	-0.023%	-0.009
injuries per capita	(p=.89)	(p=.49)	(p=.89)	(p=.49)

Questions about statistical significance

Justin Wolfers, Comments on "Economic Impacts of Terrorism"

Correlation and Causation

- "Poverty, Political Freedom and the Roots of Terrorism"
 - Alberto Abadie
 - Presented at Economics of National Security; 1/7/2005
 - Asks: What is the effect of GDP on terrorism?

What Drives These Results?

◆ Terrorism incidents per million people

- Mean: 0.26
- Median: 0
- Maximum: 47
- Standard deviation: 1.3
- ◆ Three crucial datapoints:
 - Israel (particularly in late 2000s)
 - Columbia
 - Iraq (2005)