

INDIA AND THE POST-2015 AGENDA: SHAPING THE CONNECTIONS BETWEEN LAW AND DEVELOPMENT

Conference Report

Advocates for International Development (A4ID)
www.a4id.org

Bingham Centre for the Rule of Law
www.binghamcentre.biicl.org

April 2014

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONFERENCE REPORT	1
ANNEX A: CONFERENCE PROGRAMME	9
ANNEX B: SOURCE MATERIALS	
The Millennium Development Goals: Goals, Targets and Indicators	11
Sustainable Development Goals proposed by the Open Working Groups, July 2014	15
Sustainable Development Solutions Network (SDSN) proposal for Sustainable Development Goals Indicators	17
Secretary-General's Synthesis Report, December 2014 – extract relating to justice goals	28
ANNEX C: HOST ORGANISATIONS	29

© Bingham Centre 2015. All rights reserved.

This document is available in PDF format free of charge on the websites of the Bingham Centre and Advocates for International Development (A4ID). It may be posted on other web sites as a PDF document provided that the Bingham Centre and A4ID are always acknowledged as the source. It may be downloaded to local hard disk or printed and distributed for personal use, study, research, law reform or similar purposes, provided that on all occasions it is made available free of charge and the Bingham Centre & A4ID are always acknowledged as the source. It may not, except with the express written permission of the Bingham Centre, be downloaded, printed or distributed for sale or any commercial purpose. It may not, except with the express written permission of the Bingham Centre, be reproduced in translation.

Introduction*

2015 will be a unique opportunity for the international community. The United Nations is in the process of defining a Post-2015 Development Agenda that will replace the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The Agenda, which will be launched at a UN Summit on September 25-27, 2015, will set out the aims that countries should strive to achieve in order to eradicate poverty and secure sustainable economic, social and environmental development.

The current negotiations build on the acknowledgement that the development model pursued through the MDGs is not working and that as such it should be replaced by an inclusive and sustainable model that is truly transformative.

One of the contentious points of debate—and one of the most important—has been what role the rule of law and justice will occupy in the Post-2015 Development Agenda. The significance of such discussions cannot be overstated, as they reach into the very heart of how our future will be shaped.

This paper examines these issues, paying attention to the role that India may play in the months leading up to the September summit. It is informed by, in particular, an event held by the Bingham Centre for the Rule of Law and Advocates for International Development (A4ID) in New Delhi in February 2015 to promote discussion of the rule of law in relation to the international development agenda, and consider lessons to be learned from India.

The paper consists of four parts. Part I provides a concise yet comprehensive picture of the background, context and state of negotiations of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), together with the place occupied within them by the rule of law. Part II summarises the position that has been taken to date on the Agenda generally by the Government of India and specifically on the place of the rule of law within the Agenda. Part III looks at the operation of the rule of law in the Indian context through the prism of some key themes and issues which were the focus of discussion at the New Delhi event. It begins by outlining core themes of note—improving the situation of women and children, promoting access to justice for all, and developing effective, transparent and accountable government—and then summarises what was discussed at the New Delhi event. Part IV makes some concluding observations.

I. THE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS (SDGs)

About the UN's development goals: from the MDGs to the SDGs

At the UN Millennium summit in September 2000 the Millennium Declaration was adopted. The core chapters of the Declaration were later translated into a roadmap of 8 specific MDGs that all the UN Member States and a large number of international organizations committed to strive to achieve by the end of 2015. At the 2010 MDG Summit, UN Member States took their first steps towards advancing the Development Agenda beyond 2015 and requested that the Secretary-General begin

* This has been prepared by the Bingham Centre for the Rule of Law. Some parts of it are drawn from a Briefing Paper prepared for the February 2015 event in New Delhi. It has been authored by Dr Julinda Beqiraj Swee Leng Harris, Professor Sir Jeffrey Jowell KCMG QC and Naina Patel, all of the Bingham Centre for the Rule of Law. It was prepared with the assistance of Laila Hamzi, a Research Assistant at the Bingham Centre. The Bingham Centre and A4ID are grateful to all the speakers and participants at the New Delhi event.

the process of thinking about and make recommendations on a global Development Agenda for the future.

As a result, the Post-2015 Development Agenda is now being designed as a product of various work streams, each of which will inform the discussions before the General Assembly in September 2015.

One stream has been the High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons, a UN Secretary General ('SG') multi-stakeholder initiative consisting of representatives from civil society, the private sector, academia and local governments, alongside State representatives. It has strongly recommended the inclusion of the rule of law in Post-2015 Development Agenda.¹

Another stream flowed out of the UN Rio+20 Conference on Sustainable Development. Its outcome document proposed that a new set of goals, the so-called Sustainable Development Goals ('SDGs'), be prepared by an Open Working Group ('OWG') led by governments. Those goals, it was said, should build on the foundations of the MDGs, complete them and respond to new challenges. In the outcome document of the Rio+20 conference,² although the rule of law was not among the specific topics in the framework for action and follow up, it was referred to as a means of implementation of sustainable development commitments.³

In September 2013, the UN Member States concluded that the two processes should be coordinated. There was also shared agreement on the need to work towards a single framework and set of goals that should feed into the negotiations on a new UN Sustainable Development Agenda to be adopted in September 2015.

The SDGs are set to differ from the MDGs in important ways. First, the MDGs were drawn up without any consultation with those affected by them. Secondly, the MDGs gave insufficient attention to the root causes of poverty for the holistic nature of development. Thirdly, while in theory applicable to all countries, in reality the MDGs were considered targets for poor countries to achieve with finance from wealthy countries. This time around, the UN has conducted the largest consultation programme in its history to gauge opinion on what the SDGs should include.

On 14-19 July 2014, the OWG completed its work by adopting a final compilation of 17 proposed goals and 169 targets on sustainable development for the Post-2015 Development Agenda. Just as the existing MDG framework does, the proposed SDG framework has goals (which spell out the general objectives to be achieved) and targets (which are specific objectives). The idea is that the goals can be realised by achieving the specific, measurable targets, for which indicators will be set in due course.

The Sustainable Development Agenda, the rule of law and access to justice

Both the High-Level Panel and the OWG recognize the importance of the rule of law for the Post-2015 Development Agenda, acknowledging the links between the advancement of the rule of law

¹ *A New Global Partnership: Eradicate Poverty and Transform Economies Through Sustainable Development*, Report of the High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons on the Post-2015 Development Agenda, 2013.

² United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development, Rio+20, <https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/rio20.html>.

³ United Nations, *Future We Want*, Outcome document, September 2012, <http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/futurewewant.html>.

and the achievement of sustainable development in each of its three dimensions—economic, social and environmental.

The 2013 report of the High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons reflected the importance of the rule of law by proposing the concept specifically and very prominently among the set of illustrative goals that should inspire the Post-2015 Development Agenda. In the same vein, the different versions of the proposed SDGs adopted by the OWG, up to the so-called ‘zero draft version’ of 2 June 2014, contained a stand-alone goal on the rule of law.

However, in the final OWG report ‘the rule of law’ in Goal 16 was substituted with ‘access to justice’, and the Goal now reads, ‘Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels.’⁴ Although the rule of law is not specifically mentioned as a goal, the reference to ‘access to justice’ contains at least one important ingredient of the rule of law—the others being the notion of legality (that all be subject to law, including government officials); optimum certainty and equal application of the law. However, the reference to the rule of law is nevertheless maintained in both the preamble of the OWG document and in Target 16.3, which reads: ‘promote the rule of law at the national and international levels, and ensure equal access to justice for all’.

The UK has been vocal in support of the Post-2015 process and on the topic of Goal 16 in particular. The UK Prime Minister co-chaired the High-Level Panel with the Presidents of Indonesia and Liberia and has been vocal about the rule of law as part of the ‘golden thread’ of development.

Current developments and the way ahead

More recently, the General Assembly has turned its deliberations to the shape of the Agenda to be adopted in September 2015. It has decided that the outcome document will include the following main components: a declaration; the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and targets; the means of implementation and the global partnership for development; and a follow-up and review.

As regards the content of the SDGs, the Post-2015 Development Agenda is expected to have at its core the SDGs that were adopted in July 2014 by the OWG. This was confirmed by the UN Secretary General’s advanced version of his Synthesis Report released in December 2014.⁵ The Synthesis Report pulls together a range of UN inputs with a view to enabling States to adopt a ‘concise and aspirational’ Sustainable Development Agenda and should help with facilitating the intergovernmental negotiations ahead. Its end product is an integrated set of six essential elements: dignity, people, prosperity, planet, justice, and partnership. Element 5—‘justice’—covers the same ground as Goal 16 in the OWG’s report. The key question Member States are considering is how these elements will be integrated into the SDGs text that will be negotiated in the coming months.

By confirming the importance of the OWG’s proposal, the Synthesis Report discards the criticisms concerning the length and complexity of the proposed SDGs (17 goals and 169 targets). On the contrary, it asserts that the extensive coverage of the OWG document should be praised as a paradigm shift (‘a remarkable step forward’) in the efforts to address an increasingly complex global agenda.

⁴ Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, available at <https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/sdgsproposal>

⁵ Synthesis report of the Secretary-General on the Post-2015 Sustainable Development Agenda, *The road to dignity by 2030: ending poverty, transforming all lives and protecting the planet*, 4 December 2014, available at http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/69/700&Lang=E

Accordingly, the Report suggests that there should not be any substantial dilution or contraction of the goals proposed by the OWG.

However, at the same time, the SG calls for a focused and concise rearrangement of the goals. In the light of this, the six essential elements identified in the Synthesis Report should not be taken as a reformulation of the goals but rather as a concise construction of 'clusters' which must be reflected in the Development Agenda and which should help to streamline its implementation and delivery.

The 'justice' cluster is envisioned 'to promote safe and peaceful societies and strong institutions'. This covers many of the issues currently addressed in Goal 16 and its related targets in the OWG document. Notably, the Report acknowledges the central importance of the rule of law in achieving sustainable development, both in general and specifically, in the context of the element of justice.

In the light of the SG's invitation to rearrange the goals and targets in the OWG report in a 'focused and concise manner', the question that emerges is: how might the rule of law be most appropriately located within the Development Agenda?

As a core and indispensable element of empowerment, stability and development it is vital that the rule of law occupies a firm and clear place in the Development Agenda for the fifteen years that follow. The SG's endorsement of the OWG report, the identification of 'justice' as one of the core elements of the Post-2015 Agenda and the recognition of the centrality of the rule of law in achieving sustainable development are all critical steps forward in this regard. Things have moved along positively since the concept of the rule of law was removed from the main text of the proposed SDGs and it was not at all clear what place, if any, the rule of law and access to justice would occupy in the Development Agenda. Failure to include the rule of law or its components in the Post-2015 Agenda as an essential driver of development will perpetuate some of the errors and omissions of the MDGs, and it will be much more difficult to achieve respect for the human dignity of the poor and marginalised.

Measuring Goal 16 and its Targets

Alongside the formulation of the goals and targets, another important dimension of the current negotiations is the identification of indicators capable of measuring the transformative impact of the action undertaken by States in the context of the Development Agenda.

Among the many processes directed at identifying suitable indicators, the Sustainable Development Solutions network (SDSN)—an initiative launched by the UN SG in August 2012—has compiled a draft set of 100 indicators for the OWG goals.⁶ Possible indicators for Goal 16 are already comprised in the SDSN report. These include, among others, the level of school enrolment and completion ratio; the level of birth registrations; the percentage of criminal cases of sexual and gender-based violence against women and children investigated and sentenced; or perception of public sector corruption. The data are either already available to different UN bodies and agencies or collected by national authorities.

Supplementary indicators that specifically measure progress in relation to the rule of law and access to justice could be added. Examples include indicators for access to the courts (the legal aid budget

⁶ *Indicators and a Monitoring Framework for Sustainable Development Goals Launching a data revolution for the SDGs*, A report by the Leadership Council of the Sustainable Development Solutions Network, Revised working draft for consultation, 16 January 2015, available at <http://unsdsn.org/resources/publications/indicators/>

per capita); judicial independence (statistics in relation to appointments, tenure and dismissals); the effectiveness of the judiciary (the human and economic resources of the judicial branch e.g. the ratio between GDP and the budget allocated to the judicial branch, the number of full time equivalent judges per 100,000 inhabitants disaggregated by court level and by sex); indicators of fair procedures and enforcement (the average length of pre-trial detention; the ratio of resolved cases by year to the total of unresolved ongoing cases); and perception data on the degree of trust in the justice system. Again, much of the respective data are already available through international reporting and national administrative data. This should not therefore be a bar to a more granular approach to the 'justice' cluster.

II. THE INDIAN GOVERNMENT'S POSITION ON THE SDG'S, JUSTICE AND THE RULE OF LAW

India is the world's largest democracy and has recently dethroned China as the fastest-growing big economy,⁷ but it continues to face significant development challenges. However, such traits, together with its rich, multi-ethnic, multi-cultural, multi-religious and multi-lingual society, mean that India has a crucial role to play in the drafting and implementation of the Post-2015 Development Agenda. India is home to one-sixth of the world's population, and as Shamsad Akhtar, Executive Secretary of the UN Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) recently observed, 'the world is not going to achieve the SDGs, if India does not.'⁸

India has been vocal about the self-evident, multiple and mutually reinforcing links between the rule of law and development, endorsing the Open Working Group Report and so Goal 16, while underscoring challenges of measurability, the need to be sensitive to local contexts in allowing countries to find their own pathways to both goals and targets, and the need to avoid subsuming development within the discourse on human rights.⁹

Official statements made by India's representatives at the UN confirm that India attaches great importance to the post-2015 negotiations with poverty eradication as its overarching objective. India also considers that there are important mutually reinforcing links between human rights, the rule of law and development, but also that greater attention should be placed on the promotion of the rule of law at the international level. Among the areas in which India can make a substantive contribution to the Post-2015 Development Agenda, there are at least two that need to be highlighted.

First, India is strongly committed to democracy and believes that this is a necessary component of holistic development. That is to say that there is official recognition that people's participation in an open and democratic polity is essential for their empowerment and enables better choices and better development outcomes. This is a key-driver of development that was not explicitly factored into the MDGs framework, but the role of which is now being recognized as crucial to the successful achievement of those goals. India's commitment to democracy was confirmed by the elections which took place in May 2014. It is now reflected in the target of developing 'Effective, accountable and transparent institutions' which sits in the Post-2015 Sustainable Development Agenda under Goal 16.

⁷ The Wall Street Journal, India, 11 February 2015: <http://blogs.wsj.com/indiarealtime/2015/02/11/its-official-india-has-passed-china-to-become-the-worlds-fastest-growing-economy/>

⁸ Source: http://www.unescap.org/sites/default/files/Formatted_Press%20release_India%20MDG.pdf

⁹ Statements by the Indian Government before the General Assembly. See <https://www.pminewyork.org/pages.php?id=1971> ; <https://www.pminewyork.org/pages.php?id=1936>.

Secondly, India recognizes the importance of the empowerment of people in achieving poverty eradication. It strives to ensure that economic growth reaches the most vulnerable, yet also the most significant sections of society, particularly, rural India where 65% of the people live, and women and children who constitute over 70% of the population. According to a recent report on the achievement of MDGs, despite good achievements on the other goals and targets, India is lagging behind on: targets for primary school enrolment and completion and universal youth literacy (Goal 2); empowering women through wage employment and political participation (Goal 3); reducing child and infant mortality (Goal 4); improving maternal health (Goal 5); and improving access to sanitation facilities (Goal 7).¹⁰ The need to address these kind of issues is reflected in the target of 'improving the situation of women and children' which sits in the Post-2015 Development Agenda under Goal 16.

India also recognizes that the rule of law, human rights and development are linked in multiple ways and are mutually reinforcing. The Goal 16 targets cover different drivers that could improve the levels of empowerment of the most vulnerable groups of society. Empowerment involves legal empowerment, which begins with literacy, education and awareness of rights, and extends to effective access to justice through fair hearings in independent courts. These are elements of crucial importance in achieving the realization and enforcement of constitutional rights and guarantees. Some of these issues are reflected in the target of 'access to justice for all' which sits in the Post-2015 Sustainable Development Agenda under Goal 16.

India is making particular strides on empowerment because digital technology is being increasingly employed as an empowerment tool, via the dissemination of general legal information and the provision of informal legal education and India is leading some of the efforts in this regard. While the success of this approach is heavily dependent on the availability of and access to such technology in specific countries and/or areas, India is a champion of the use of information and communications technology for development and this will increase the effectiveness of its development policies.

III: THE NEW DELHI CONFERENCE: KEY THEMES, EMERGING ISSUES

Conference Programme: Specific Topics in Law and Development

There are many topics within the discussion of the SDGs and the rule of law that are of interest, however, the New Delhi event focused on the following areas. Each of these areas is highly topical, helps to illustrate the distinction between the rule of law and access to justice, and demonstrates the wealth of initiatives and innovations offered by India for others to consider as part of the broader SDG discussions.¹¹

Improving the situation of women and children (target 16.2) and access to justice for all (target 16.3)

Women and children are particularly vulnerable groups whose situation poses particular challenges in terms of standards of living and development. The rule of law requires that the law should protect people equally, without discrimination. Only when women and children enjoy equal protection through rule of law can they prosper economically and participate in social and economic development. In this way, the rule of law forms part of the enabling environment for development with regard to these vulnerable groups. The rule of law has worked to assist in reducing the abuse and

¹⁰ http://www.unescap.org/sites/default/files/India_and_the_MDGs_rev_small_2.pdf

¹¹ The full conference programme is attached as Appendix A.

exploitation of such groups in India through amendments to the criminal law addressing sexual violence, and the introduction of new legislation such as the Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act. Important and useful methodologies have also been devised for monitoring the effectiveness of such legislation.

Access to justice is important for all citizens and to the rule of law generally, but it is particularly important for vulnerable groups to ensure that they have access to means by which to seek redress and defend their rights. The principle of access to justice concerns both the ability of people from all backgrounds to access fair mechanisms for resolving disputes as well as the quality of justice which provides social justice to marginalised people. An example of an Indian initiative in this regard in India is the fast-track courts which have been established in some areas to address rape cases, which can improve access to courts and thus access to justice in such cases.

Developing effective, transparent and accountable government (targets 16.5-16.6)

Government transparency and accountability to citizens is of great importance for development, because citizens' interests are more likely to be furthered by the decisions of a government which boasts such characteristics. Without them, power can be concentrated in the hands of entrenched interests, and economic development can have adverse social and environmental consequences, resulting in development that is both unbalanced and unsustainable. Transparency and open government enable public participation in government, efficiency in decision-making and reduce the opportunities for corruption. India's Right to Information Act, 2005 ('RTI Act') is an important tool in promoting government transparency, and civil society in India is a key actor in the successful realisation of the aims and full potential of that legislation.

A further way in which citizens can hold the government to account to ensure that government power is exercised properly is through judicial review, the effectiveness of which depends on the efficient and effective operation of the courts. Courts in India play a vital role in interpreting and enforcing the Constitution, ensuring that government power is exercised in accordance with the Constitution, and guaranteeing that it remains effective and accountable. Important reforms that are taking place in the Supreme Court's E-Committee are also taking innovative steps towards improving the efficient and effective operation of the Courts.

Although there is general acceptance of the importance to development of transparent and accountable government institutions, this is an area in which measurement through monitoring and evaluation remains a challenging issue.

IV. CONCLUDING OBSERVATIONS

There is an important discussion to be had around what the concept of the rule of law adds to that of access to justice as part of the SDG negotiations. Whatever the outcome of such discussions, given the current status of negotiations, it seems unlikely that the rule of law will be reintroduced as part of one of the SDG goals as such. Nonetheless, the current inclusion of the concept of justice in negotiations, and the inclusion of the rule of law as a target, remain important as an opportunity for consideration of the rule of law and effective governmental institutions as part of development. However the SDG negotiations must engage and reflect Southern voices and experience.

In order for the SDGs to be successful, it is crucial that countries such as India participate in the negotiations, and see their views and interests reflected in the outcomes. As discussed in this paper, the SDG negotiations provide a crucial opportunity for the role of the rule of law in development to be recognised and prioritised. It would be disappointing if authoritative voices from the Global South—such as India as the world’s largest democracy and one that places great value on the rule of law—were not playing an influential role in those negotiations and their views not reflected in the outcomes.

India provides examples of the importance of access to justice, particularly through public interest litigation, but although Courts play this important role they also have scope for reform. The willingness of Indian courts to make decisions that affect the lives of citizens generally, not just the litigants in a case, has increased the impact of access to justice. There have been important reforms already with regard to courts’ transparency, anti-corruption and equality before the law with regard to women’s rights. However, there is scope for further improvement in some judges’ attitudes towards women and thus the operation of courts as institutions that apply the law to protect women as equal to men. Furthermore, the issue of pendency—cases remaining pending because it takes a long time to close them—highlighted by speakers presents an on-going challenge to access to justice, despite the efforts already made to improve the speed with which cases are concluded.

India also provides examples of transparency and anti-corruption initiatives for Government institutions, particularly its Right to Information Act. India’s legal reforms and transparency initiatives like the Open Data portal and the projects of Daksh provide examples of ways to address problems of accountability, good governance and effective institutions that can be considered when setting the indicators for the SDGs and more generally by other countries. Political movements promoting anti-corruption are increasingly gathering strength and may be the harbinger of further improvements.

Finally, upcoming SDG negotiations over how to measure progress towards the achievement of goals are an area of fundamental importance, and the cross-cutting nature of the importance of measurement was demonstrated in the comments of speakers. Much of the content and success of the SDGs will depend on what will be measured and how. It is therefore necessary to continue working on innovative and improved ways to measure different aspects of the rule of law, including access to justice, good governance and accountability. It is also important that the indicators and measurements under the SDGs are relevant to the realities of the global south, for example, measuring access to justice in broader terms than only the number of judges relative to the population.

ANNEX A: CONFERENCE PROGRAMME

INDIA AND THE POST-2015 AGENDA: SHAPING THE CONNECTIONS BETWEEN LAW AND DEVELOPMENT

Friday, 27 February 2015

The India International Centre (Annexe)
Lecture Room 2, Basement (Annexe)
40 Max Mueller Marg
New Delhi -110003

13:30	REGISTRATION, TEA & COFFEE
14:00	<p>WELCOME AND OPENING KEYNOTE ADDRESS</p> <p><u>Speakers:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Yasmin Batliwala, Chief Executive, Advocates for International Development (welcome) ○ Professor Sir Jeffrey Jowell KCMG QC, Director of Bingham Centre (introduction)
	THE PLACE OF GOAL 16 IN THE POST-2015 AGENDA FOR THE WORLD
14:30	<p>INTRODUCTION</p> <p>About the MDGs, SDGs the post 2015 agenda, access to justice and the ROL and the measurement challenge</p> <p><u>Speakers:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Professor Sir Jeffrey Jowell KCMG QC, Director of the Bingham Centre (Chair) ○ Mr Amitabh Behar, WNTA ○ Professor Ajay Shah, National Institute of Public Finance and Policy ○ Mr Jairam Ramesh, Member of Parliament ○ Professor Sudarshan Ramaswamy, Dean, OP Jindal University <p>The speakers will give an overall presentation of these concepts and of the state of negotiations the arguments made for and against including a rule of law dimension in the post -2015 agenda (including the arguments around the challenges of measurement), India's position on these issues, the language shift in Goal 16 from ROL to access to justice and the consequences thereof.</p> <p>The speakers will also comment on the universal values at the core of the rule of law, on their adaptability to domestic priorities and local needs in India and their relevance to both developed and developing countries in general as well as the issues which affect them both, such as climate change – and hence the value of including the rule of law in Goal 16.</p>
16:00	BREAK – TEA AND COFFEE

	THE RELEVANCE OF THE RULE OF LAW TO THE GOAL 16 TARGETS
16:15	<p>Improving the situation of women and children and access to justice for all (targets 16.2-16.3)</p> <p><u>Speakers:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Mrs Justice Leila Seth, Former Chief Justice of the Himachal Pradesh High Court ○ Ms Gayatri Sharma, Research and Advocacy Officer, Lawyers Collective ○ Ms Ruchira Gupta, Founder and President of Apne Aap Women Worldwide ○ Ms Meenakshi Lekhi, Member of Parliament in the Lok Sabha for New Delhi <p>The speakers will discuss the challenges presented by the situation of vulnerable groups such as women and children, how the rule of law has worked to assist in reducing the abuse and exploitation of such groups and the measurement of the work that has been done in this regard in the Indian context.</p> <p>The speakers will also comment on access to justice both in the sense of the ability of a wide range of people to access mechanisms which provide justice as well as in the sense of a quality of justice which provides social justice – not simply in terms of human rights - to marginalised people, drawing on the Indian experience. There will also be a discussion around measurement of access to justice, learning from the Indian context.</p>
17:45	<p>Developing effective, transparent and accountable government (targets 16.5-16.6)</p> <p><u>Speakers:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Mr Harish Salve, Former Solicitor General of India and Supreme Court Advocate (Chair) ○ Mr Justice Lokur, Justice of the Supreme Court of India ○ Ms Karuna Nundy, Supreme Court Advocate ○ Mr Venkatesh Nayak, Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative ○ Mr Harish Narasappa, Daksh <p>The speakers will consider the rule of law as a tool for developing effective, transparent and accountable government, demonstrating the breadth of the concept of the rule of law when compared with concepts such access to justice and human rights.</p> <p>The speakers will discuss how transparency and open government enable participation in government, efficiency in decision-making and reduce the opportunities for corruption. The speakers will also consider the role of the courts in promoting effective and accountable government. They will consider recent Indian initiatives in this regard both in the courts and in government more generally, together with the measurement possibilities this raises.</p>
19:15	<p>CONCLUDING REMARKS</p> <p><u>Speakers:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Mr Soli Sorabjee, Former Attorney General of India (Chair) ○ Naina Patel, Director of Education and Training, Bingham Centre
19:30	CLOSE

ANNEX B: SOURCE MATERIALS

THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS: GOALS, TARGETS AND INDICATORS¹²

The Millennium Development Goals and targets come from the Millennium Declaration, signed by 189 countries, including 147 heads of State and Government, in September 2000 (<http://www.un.org/millennium/declaration/ares552e.htm>) and from further agreement by member states at the 2005 World Summit (Resolution adopted by the General Assembly - A/RES/60/1, <http://www.un.org/Docs/journal/asp/ws.asp?m=A/RES/60/1>).

The goals and targets are interrelated and should be seen as a whole. They represent a partnership between the developed countries and the developing countries "to create an environment – at the national and global levels alike – which is conducive to development and the elimination of poverty.

The indicators are indicators for monitoring progress. All indicators should be disaggregated by sex and urban/rural as far as possible.

Source: <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Host.aspx?Content=indicators/officialist.htm>

MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS (MDGS)	
GOALS AND TARGETS	INDICATORS
GOAL 1: ERADICATE EXTREME POVERTY AND HUNGER	
Target 1.A: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than one dollar a day	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Proportion of population below \$1.25 (PPP) per day (For monitoring country poverty trends, indicators based on national poverty lines should be used, where available) •Poverty gap ratio •Share of poorest quintile in national consumption
Target 1.B: Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Growth rate of GDP per person employed •Employment-to-population ratio •Proportion of employed people living below \$1.25 (PPP) per day

¹² <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Host.aspx?Content=indicators/officialist.htm>
All indicators should be disaggregated by sex and urban/rural as far as possible.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Proportion of own-account and contributing family workers in total employment
Target 1.C: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Prevalence of underweight children under-five years of age •Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption
GOAL 2: ACHIEVE UNIVERSAL PRIMARY EDUCATION	
Target 2.A: Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Net enrolment ratio in primary education •Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach last grade of primary •Literacy rate of 15-24 year-olds, women and men
GOAL 3: PROMOTE GENDER EQUALITY AND EMPOWER WOMEN	
Target 3.A: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Ratios of girls to boys in primary, secondary and tertiary education •Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector •Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament
GOAL 4: REDUCE CHILD MORTALITY	
Target 4.A: Reduce by two-thirds, between 1990 and 2015, the under-five mortality rate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Under-five mortality rate •Infant mortality rate •Proportion of 1 year-old children immunised against measles
GOAL 5: IMPROVE MATERNAL HEALTH	
Target 5.A: Reduce by three quarters, between 1990 and 2015, the maternal mortality ratio	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Maternal mortality ratio • Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel
Target 5.B: Achieve, by 2015, universal access to reproductive health	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Contraceptive prevalence rate •Adolescent birth rate •Antenatal care coverage (at least one visit and at least four visits) •Unmet need for family planning
GOAL 6: COMBAT HIV/AIDS, MALARIA AND OTHER DISEASES	
Target 6.A: Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •HIV prevalence among population aged 15-24 years •Condom use at last high-risk sex •Proportion of population aged 15-24 years with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS •Ratio of school attendance of orphans to school attendance of non-orphans aged 10-14 years

Target 6.B: Achieve, by 2010, universal access to treatment for HIV/AIDS for all those who need it	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Proportion of population with advanced HIV infection with access to antiretroviral drugs
Target 6.C: Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Incidence and death rates associated with malaria •Proportion of children under 5 sleeping under insecticide-treated bednets •Proportion of children under 5 with fever who are treated with appropriate anti-malarial drugs •Incidence, prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis •Proportion of tuberculosis cases detected and cured under directly observed treatment short course
GOAL 7: ENSURE ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY	
Target 7.A: Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Proportion of land area covered by forest •CO2 emissions, total, per capita and per \$1 GDP (PPP) •Consumption of ozone-depleting substances •Proportion of fish stocks within safe biological limits •Proportion of total water resources used •Proportion of terrestrial and marine areas protected •Proportion of species threatened with extinction
Target 7.B: Reduce biodiversity loss, achieving, by 2010, a significant reduction in the rate of loss	
Target 7.C: Halve, by 2015, the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Proportion of population using an improved drinking water source •Proportion of population using an improved sanitation facility
Target 7.D: By 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Proportion of urban population living in slums (The actual proportion of people living in slums is measured by a proxy, represented by the urban population living in households with at least one of the four characteristics: (a) lack of access to improved water supply; (b) lack of access to improved sanitation; (c) overcrowding (3 or more persons per room); and (d) dwellings made of non-durable material.)
GOAL 8: DEVELOP A GLOBAL PARTNERSHIP FOR DEVELOPMENT	
Target 8.A: Develop further an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system Includes a commitment to good governance, development and poverty reduction – both nationally and internationally	<p><i>Some of the indicators listed below are monitored separately for the least developed countries (LDCs), Africa, landlocked developing countries and small island developing States.</i></p> <p><u>Official development assistance (ODA)</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Net ODA, total and to the least developed countries, as percentage of OECD/DAC donors' gross national income •Proportion of total bilateral, sector-allocable ODA of OECD/DAC donors to basic social services (basic education, primary health care, nutrition, safe water and sanitation) •Proportion of bilateral official development assistance of OECD/DAC donors that is untied •ODA received in landlocked developing countries as a proportion of their gross national incomes
Target 8.B: Address the special needs of the least developed countries Includes: tariff and quota free access for the least developed countries' exports; enhanced programme of debt relief for heavily indebted poor countries (HIPC) and cancellation of official bilateral debt; and more generous ODA for countries committed to poverty reduction	

<p>Target 8.C: Address the special needs of landlocked developing countries and small island developing States (through the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States and the outcome of the twenty-second special session of the General Assembly)</p> <p>Target 8.D: Deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing countries through national and international measures in order to make debt sustainable in the long term</p> <p>Target 8.E: In cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, provide access to affordable essential drugs in developing countries</p> <p>Target 8.F: In cooperation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •ODA received in small island developing States as a proportion of their gross national incomes <p><u>Market access</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Proportion of total developed country imports (by value and excluding arms) from developing countries and least developed countries, admitted free of duty •Average tariffs imposed by developed countries on agricultural products and textiles and clothing from developing countries •Agricultural support estimate for OECD countries as a percentage of their gross domestic product •Proportion of ODA provided to help build trade capacity <p><u>Debt sustainability</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Total number of countries that have reached their HIPC decision points and number that have reached their HIPC completion points (cumulative) •Debt relief committed under HIPC and MDRI Initiatives •Debt service as a percentage of exports of goods and services •Proportion of population with access to affordable essential drugs on a sustainable basis <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Fixed-telephone subscriptions per 100 inhabitants •Mobile-cellular subscriptions per 100 inhabitants •Internet users per 100 inhabitants
---	--

OWG REPORT, JULY 2014 - PROPOSED SDGs¹³

- Goal 1 End poverty in all its forms everywhere
- Goal 2 End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition and promote sustainable agriculture
- Goal 3 Ensure healthy lives and promote well being for all at all ages
- Goal 4 Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all
- Goal 5 Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls
- Goal 6 Ensure availability and sustainable management of water and sanitation for all
- Goal 7 Ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy for all
- Goal 8 Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all
- Goal 9 Build resilient infrastructure, promote inclusive and sustainable industrialization and foster innovation
- Goal 10 Reduce inequality within and among countries
- Goal 11 Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable
- Goal 12 Ensure sustainable consumption and production patterns
- Goal 13 Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts*
- Goal 14 Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources for sustainable development
- Goal 15 Protect, restore and promote sustainable use of terrestrial ecosystems, sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, and halt and reverse land degradation and halt biodiversity loss
- Goal 16 Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels
- Goal 17 Strengthen the means of implementation and revitalize the global partnership for sustainable development

GOAL 16 TARGETS

Goal 16. Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels

- 16.1 significantly reduce all forms of violence and related death rates everywhere

¹³ The Open Working Group agreed to submit its proposal on sustainable development goals to the General Assembly on 19 July 2014. The full report of the Open Working Group is issued as document A/68/970 and is available at <http://undocs.org/A/68/970>.

- 16.2 end abuse, exploitation, trafficking and all forms of violence and torture against children
- 16.3 promote the rule of law at the national and international levels, and ensure equal access to justice for all
- 16.4 by 2030 significantly reduce illicit financial and arms flows, strengthen recovery and return of stolen assets, and combat all forms of organized crime
- 16.5 substantially reduce corruption and bribery in all its forms
- 16.6 develop effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels
- 16.7 ensure responsive, inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making at all levels
- 16.8 broaden and strengthen the participation of developing countries in the institutions of global governance
- 16.9 by 2030 provide legal identity for all including birth registration
- 16.10 ensure public access to information and protect fundamental freedoms, in accordance with national legislation and international agreements

- 16.a strengthen relevant national institutions, including through international cooperation, for building capacities at all levels, in particular in developing countries, for preventing violence and combating terrorism and crime
- 16.b promote and enforce non-discriminatory laws and policies for sustainable development

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT SOLUTIONS NETWORK (SDSN)

SUGGESTED SDG INDICATORS

The Sustainable Development Solutions Network (SDSN) was launched by the UN Secretary-General, Ban Ki Moon in August 2012. It mobilizes scientific and technical expertise from academia, civil society, and the private sector in support of sustainable development problem solving at local, national, and global scales. The table below is drawn from a working draft report prepared by the SDSN, *Indicators and a Monitoring Framework for the SDGs*.¹⁴

INDICATOR NUMBER	POTENTIAL AND INDICATIVE INDICATOR	POTENTIAL LEAD AGENCY OR AGENCIES	OTHER GOALS INDICATOR APPLIES TO
GOAL 1. END POVERTY IN ALL ITS FORMS EVERYWHERE			
1	Proportion of population below \$1.25 (PPP) per day (MDG Indicator)	World Bank	8
2	Proportion of population living below national poverty line, differentiated by urban and rural (modified MDG indicator)	World Bank, UN DESA	11
3	Multidimensional Poverty Index	UNDP, World Bank, UNSD, UNICEF	2, 3, 4, 8, 11
4	Percentage of population covered by social protection programs	ILO	8, 10, 11
5	Percentage of population in rural areas with secure rights to land, measured by (i) percentage with documented or recognized evidence of tenure, and (ii) percentage who perceive their rights to land are recognized and protected	FAO, UNDP	2, 5, 10, 11
6	Losses from natural disasters, by climate and non-climate-related events, by urban/rural (in US\$ and lives lost)	UNISDR, FAO, WHO, CRED	2, 6, 11, 13
	Complementary National Indicators: 1.1. Poverty gap ratio (MDG Indicator) 1.2. Percentage of population with access to banking services (including mobile banking) 1.3. [Disaster Risk Reduction Indicator] - to be developed		
GOAL 2. END HUNGER, ACHIEVE FOOD SECURITY AND IMPROVED NUTRITION, AND PROMOTE SUSTAINABLE AGRICULTURE			
7	Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption (MDG Indicator)	FAO, WHO	3
8	Prevalence of anemia in women of reproductive age (including pregnant)	FAO, WHO	3

¹⁴ The most recent version of the report, available here: <http://unsdsn.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/01/150116-Indicators-and-a-Monitoring-Framework-for-SDGs-working-draft-for-consultation.pdf>, incorporates comments drawn from a 2014 public consultation and the recommendations of the Secretary-General, as set out in his synthesis report, *The Road to Dignity by 2030*, amongst several others.

9	Prevalence of stunting and wasting in children under [5] years of age	WHO, UNICEF	1, 3
10	Crop yield gap (actual yield as % of attainable yield)	FAO	
11	Number of agricultural extension workers per 1000 farmers [or share of farmers covered by agricultural extension programs and services]	FAO	
12	[Nitrogen use efficiency in food systems] – to be developed	FAO, International Fertilizer Industry Association (IFA)	
13	[Phosphorus use efficiency in food systems] - to be developed	[UNEP or other agency, TBD]	12
14	[Access to drying, storage and processing facilities] - to be developed	FAO	
15	Annual change in degraded or desertified arable land (% or ha)	FAO, UNEP	15
16	[Crop water productivity (tons of harvested product per unit irrigation water)] – to be developed	FAO	6
	<p>Complementary National Indicators:</p> <p>2.1. Percentage of population with shortfalls of: iron, zinc, iodine, vitamin A, folate, vitamin B12, [and vitamin D]</p> <p>2.2. Proportion of infants 6–23 months of age who receive a minimum acceptable diet</p> <p>2.3. Cereal yield growth rate (% p.a.)</p> <p>2.4. Livestock yield gap (actual yield as % of attainable yield).</p> <p>2.5. Share of calories from non-staple crops</p> <p>2.6. Percentage of total daily energy intake from protein in adults</p> <p>2.7. [Indicator on genetic diversity in agriculture] - to be developed</p> <p>2.8. [Indicator on irrigation access gap] - to be developed</p> <p>2.9. [Farmers with nationally appropriate crop insurance (%)] - to be developed</p> <p>2.10. Public and private R&D expenditure on agriculture and rural development (% of GNI)</p> <p>2.11. [Indicator on food price volatility] - to be developed</p>		
GOAL 3. ENSURE HEALTHY LIVES AND PROMOTE WELL-BEING FOR ALL AT ALL AGES			
17	Maternal mortality ratio (MDG Indicator) and rate	WHO, UN Population Division, UNICEF, World Bank	5
18	Neonatal, infant, and under-five mortality rates (modified MDG Indicator)	WHO, UNICEF, UN Population Division	
19	HIV incidence, treatment rate, and mortality (modified MDG Indicator)	WHO, UNAIDS	

20	Incidence, prevalence, and death rates associated with TB (MDG Indicator)	WHO	
21	Incidence and death rates associated with malaria (MDG Indicator)	WHO	
22	Probability of dying between exact ages 30 and 70 from any of cardiovascular disease, cancer, diabetes, or chronic respiratory disease	WHO	11
23	Current use of any tobacco product (age-standardized rate)	WHO	12
24	Harmful use of alcohol	WHO	12
25	Percent of population overweight and obese	WHO	12
26	[Functioning programs of multisectoral mental health promotion and prevention in existence] - to be developed	WHO	
27	Road traffic deaths per 100,000 population	WHO	9, 11
28	[Consultations with a licensed provider in a health facility or the community per person, per year] - to be developed	WHO	
29	[Percentage of population without effective financial protection for health care] - to be developed	WHO	11
30	Percent of children receiving full immunization (as recommended by WHO)	UNICEF, GAVI, WHO	
31	Contraceptive prevalence rate (MDG Indicator)	UN Population Division and UNFPA	5
32	Healthy life expectancy at birth	WHO	
33	Mean urban air pollution of particulate matter (PM10 and PM2.5)	UN-Habitat, UNEP, WHO	9, 11, 12
	Complementary National Indicators: 3.1. Percentage of births attended by skilled health personnel (MDG Indicator) 3.2. Antenatal care coverage (at least one visit and at least four visits) (MDG Indicator) 3.3. Post-natal care coverage (one visit) 3.4. Coverage of iron-folic acid supplements for pregnant women (%) 3.5. Incidence rate of diarrheal disease in children under five years 3.6. Percentage of exclusive breastfeeding for the first 6 months of life 3.7. Percentage children born with low birth weight 3.8. Percentage of 1 year-old children immunized against measles (MDG Indicator) 3.9. Percent HIV+ pregnant women receiving PMTCT 3.10. Condom use at last high-risk sex (MDG Indicator)		

	<p>3.11. Percentage of tuberculosis cases detected and cured under directly observed treatment short course (MDG Indicator)</p> <p>3.12. Percentage of children under 5 with fever who are treated with appropriate anti-malarial drugs (MDG Indicator)</p> <p>3.13. Percentage of people in malaria-endemic areas sleeping under insecticide-treated bed nets (modified MDG Indicator)</p> <p>3.14. Percentage of confirmed malaria cases that receive first-line antimalarial therapy according to national policy</p> <p>3.15. Percentage of suspected malaria cases that receive a parasitological test</p> <p>3.16. Percentage of pregnant women receiving malaria IPT (in endemic areas)</p> <p>3.17. Neglected Tropical Disease (NTD) cure rate</p> <p>3.18. Incidence and death rates associated with hepatitis</p> <p>3.19. Percentage of women with cervical cancer screening</p> <p>3.20. Percentage with hypertension diagnosed & receiving treatment</p> <p>3.21. Waiting time for elective surgery</p> <p>3.22. Prevalence of insufficient physical activity</p> <p>3.23. Fraction of calories from added saturated fats and sugars</p> <p>3.24. Age-standardized mean population intake of salt (sodium chloride) per day in grams in persons aged 18+ years</p> <p>3.25. Prevalence of persons (aged 18+ years) consuming less than five total servings (400 grams) of fruit and vegetables per day</p> <p>3.26. Percentage change in per capita [red] meat consumption relative to a 2015 baseline</p> <p>3.27. Age-standardized (to world population age distribution) prevalence of diabetes (preferably based on HbA1c), hypertension, cardiovascular disease, and chronic respiratory disease.</p> <p>3.28. Household Dietary Diversity Score</p> <p>3.29. [Mortality from indoor air pollution] - to be developed</p> <p>3.30. Percentage of fully and consistently equipped and supplied service delivery points to provide basic package of services</p> <p>3.31. Percentage of population with access to affordable essential drugs and commodities on a sustainable basis</p> <p>3.32. Percentage of new health care facilities built in compliance with building codes and standards</p> <p>3.33. Public and private R&D expenditure on health (% GNP)</p> <p>3.34. Ratio of health professionals to population (MDs, nurse midwives, nurses, community health workers, EmOC caregivers)</p> <p>3.35. Percentage of women and men aged 15–49 who report discriminatory attitudes towards people living with HIV</p>		
GOAL 4. ENSURE INCLUSIVE AND EQUITABLE QUALITY EDUCATION AND PROMOTE LIFE-LONG LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES FOR ALL			
34	Percentage of children receiving at least one year of a quality pre-primary education program.	UNESCO, UNICEF, World Bank	
35	[Early Child Development Index (ECDI)] – to be developed	UNICEF, UNESCO	
36	Primary completion rates for girls and boys	UNESCO	5
37	[Percentage of girls and boys who master a broad range of foundational skills, including in literacy and mathematics by the end of the primary school cycle (based on credibly established national benchmarks)] – to be developed	UNESCO	5
38	Secondary completion rates for girls and boys	UNESCO	5, 8

39	[Percentage of girls and boys who achieve proficiency across a broad range of learning outcomes, including in literacy and in mathematics by end of the secondary schooling cycle (based on credibly established national benchmarks)] – to be developed	UNESCO	5
40	Tertiary enrollment rates for women and men	UNESCO	5, 8
	Complementary National Indicators: 4.1. [Percentage of girls and boys who acquire skills and values needed for global citizenship and sustainable development (national benchmarks to be developed) by the end of lower secondary] – to be developed 4.2. Percentage of children under 5 experiencing responsive, stimulating parenting in safe environments 4.3. [Percentage of adolescents (15-19 years) with access to school-to-work programs] - to be developed 4.4. Literacy rate of 15-24 year-olds, women and men (MDG indicator) 4.5. Percentage of young adults (18-24 years) with access to a learning program. 4.6. [Indicator on share of education facilities that provide an effective learning environment] - to be developed 4.7. [Indicator on scholarships for students from developing countries] - to be developed 4.8. [Indicator on supply of qualified teachers] - to be developed		
GOAL 5. ACHIEVE GENDER EQUALITY AND EMPOWER ALL WOMEN AND GIRLS			
41	Prevalence of women 15-49 who have experienced physical or sexual violence by an intimate partner in the last 12 months	WHO, UNSD	3
42	Percentage of referred cases of sexual and gender-based violence against women and children that are investigated and sentenced	UN Women	16
43	Percentage of women aged 20-24 who were married or in a union before age 18	UNICEF	3
44	Prevalence of harmful traditional practices, including female genital mutilation/cutting	WHO, UNICEF	3
45	Average number of hours spent on paid and unpaid work combined (total work burden), by sex	ILO with IAEG-GS (UNSD)	
46	Percentage of seats held by women and minorities in national parliament and/or sub-national elected office according to their respective share of the population (modified MDG Indicator)	Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU)	10, 16
47	Met demand for family planning (modified MDG Indicator)	UN Population Division, UNFPA	3
48	Total fertility rate	UN Population Division, UNFPA	
	Complementary National Indicators: 5.1. Gender gap in wages, by sector of economic activity 5.2. Share of women on corporate boards of national / multi-national corporations (MNCs) 5.3. Percentage of women without incomes of their own 5.4. Mean age of mother at birth of first child		

	5.5. Percentage of young people receiving comprehensive sexuality education		
GOAL 6. ENSURE AVAILABILITY AND SUSTAINABLE MANAGEMENT OF WATER AND SANITATION FOR ALL			
49	Percentage of population with access to safely managed water services, by urban/rural (modified MDG Indicator)	WHO/UNICEF Joint Monitoring Programme (JMP)	1, 2, 3, 9, 11
50	Percentage of population using safely managed sanitation services, by urban/rural (modified MDG Indicator)	WHO/UNICEF Joint Monitoring Programme (JMP)	1, 2, 3, 9, 11
51	[Percentage of wastewater flows treated to national standards, by municipal and industrial source] – to be developed	WHO/UNICEF Joint Monitoring Programme (JMP)	3, 9, 11, 12, 14
52	Proportion of total water resources used (MDG Indicator)	FAO, UNEP	2, 9, 11, 12
	<p>Complementary National Indicators:</p> <p>6.1. Percentage of population reporting practicing open defecation</p> <p>6.2. Percentage of population with basic hand washing facilities in the home</p> <p>6.3. Proportion of the population connected to collective sewers or with on-site storage of all domestic wastewaters</p> <p>6.4. Percentage of pupils enrolled in primary schools and secondary schools providing basic drinking water, adequate sanitation, and adequate hygiene services.</p> <p>6.5. Percentage of beneficiaries using hospitals, health centers and clinics providing basic drinking water, adequate sanitation, and adequate hygiene</p> <p>6.6. Proportion of the flows of treated municipal wastewater that are directly and safely reused</p> <p>6.7. [Reporting of international river shed authorities on transboundary river-shed management] - to be developed</p> <p>6.8. [Indicator on Integrated Water Resources Management (IWRM)] - to be developed</p> <p>6.9. [Indicator on international cooperation and capacity building in water and sanitation-related activities] - to be developed</p> <p>6.10. [Indicator on participation of local communities for improving water and sanitation management] - to be developed</p>		
GOAL 7. ENSURE ACCESS TO AFFORDABLE, RELIABLE, SUSTAINABLE, AND MODERN ENERGY FOR ALL			
53	Share of the population with access to modern cooking solutions, by urban/rural	Sustainable Energy for All, IEA, WHO	1, 3, 5, 9, 11, 12
54	Share of the population with access to reliable electricity, by urban/rural	Sustainable Energy for All, IEA, World Bank	1, 3, 5, 9, 11, 12
55	Implicit incentives for low-carbon energy in the electricity sector (measured as US\$/MWh or US\$ per ton avoided CO ₂)	IEA, UNFCCC	11, 13
56	Rate of primary energy intensity improvement	Sustainable Energy for All, IEA	11, 13
	<p>Complementary National Indicators:</p> <p>7.1. Primary energy by type</p>		

	7.2. Fossil fuel subsidies (\$ or %GNI)		
GOAL 8. PROMOTE SUSTAINED, INCLUSIVE AND SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC GROWTH, FULL AND PRODUCTIVE EMPLOYMENT AND DECENT WORK FOR ALL			
57	GNI per capita (PPP, current US\$ Atlas method)	IMF, World Bank, UNSD	11
58	Country implements and reports on System of Environmental-Economic Accounting (SEEA) accounts	UNSD	12, 17
59	Youth employment rate, by formal and informal sector	ILO	11
60	Ratification and implementation of fundamental ILO labor standards and compliance in law and practice	ILO	5, 9, 10, 11, 17
	Complementary National Indicators: 8.1. Growth rate of GDP per person employed (MDG indicator) 8.2. Working poverty rate measured at \$2 PPP per capita per day 8.3. [Indicator of decent work] - to be developed 8.4. Household income, including in-kind services (PPP, current US\$) 8.5. Employment to population ratio (EPR) by gender and age group (15–64) 8.6. Share of informal employment in total employment 8.7. Percentage of own-account and contributing family workers in total employment 8.8. Percentage of young people not in education, employment or training (NEET) 8.9. [Indicator on implementation of 10-year framework of programs on sustainable consumption and production] - to be developed		
GOAL 9. BUILD RESILIENT INFRASTRUCTURE, PROMOTE INCLUSIVE AND SUSTAINABLE INDUSTRIALIZATION AND FOSTER INNOVATION			
61	Access to all-weather road (% access within [x] km distance to road)	World Bank	2, 7, 11
62	Mobile broadband subscriptions per 100 inhabitants, by urban/rural	ITU	2, 11, 17
63	[Index on ICT maturity] - to be developed	ITU	17
64	Manufacturing value added (MVA) as percent of GDP	World Bank, OECD, UNIDO	8, 11
65	Researchers and technicians in R&D (per million people)	OECD, UNESCO	8, 17
66	Total energy and industry-related GHG emissions by gas and sector, expressed as production and demand-based emissions (tCO ₂ e)	UNFCCC, OECD, UNIDO	7, 11, 13
	Complementary National Indicators: 9.1. Percentage of households with Internet, by type of service by urban/rural areas 9.2. Employment in industry (% of total employment)		
GOAL 10. REDUCE INEQUALITY WITHIN AND AMONG COUNTRIES			

67	[Indicator on inequality at top end of income distribution: GNI share of richest 10% or Palma Ratio]	UNSD, World Bank, OECD	1, 8
68	Percentage of households with incomes below 50% of median income ("relative poverty")	World Bank, OECD, UNSD	1, 8
	Complementary National Indicators: 10.1. Gini Coefficient 10.2. Income/wage persistence (intergenerational socioeconomic mobility) 10.3. [Indicator on migration] - to be developed 10.4. ODA as a percentage of vulnerable countries' GNI 10.5. Net ODA to the LDCs as percentage of high-income countries' GNI (modified from MDG Indicator) 10.6. Indicator on share of LDCs / LIC representatives on boards of IMF / WB (and other institutions of governance) 10.7. [Average remittance cost] – indicator to be developed		
GOAL 11. MAKE CITIES AND HUMAN SETTLEMENTS INCLUSIVE, SAFE, RESILIENT AND SUSTAINABLE			
69	Percentage of urban population living in slums or informal settlements (MDG Indicator)	UN-Habitat and Global City Indicators Facility	1, 6
5	Percentage of women and men in urban areas with security of tenure, measured by (i) percentage with documented or recognized rights to housing, and (ii) percentage who perceive their rights to housing are recognized and protected	UN-Habitat, UNDP	1, 5
70	[Ratio of land consumption rate to population growth rate, at comparable scale] – to be developed	UN-Habitat, World Bank	3, 12
71	Percentage of people within 0.5km of public transit running at least every 20 minutes.	UN-Habitat	9
72	[Sub-national government revenues and expenditures as a percentage of general government revenues and expenditures] –to be developed	IMF, World Bank, UN-Habitat, OECD	13, 17
	Complementary National Indicators: 11.1. Area of public space as a proportion of total city space 11.2. [Indicator on urban-rural economic linkages] - to be developed 11.3. City Biodiversity Index (Singapore Index) 11.4. [Indicator on supporting LDCs for sustainable and resilient buildings using local materials] - to be developed 11.5. [Percentage of urban solid waste regularly collected and well managed] – to be developed 11.6. Percentage of cities with more than 100,000 inhabitants that are implementing risk reduction and resilience strategies informed by accepted international frameworks (such as forthcoming Hyogo-2 framework) 11.7. Presence of a national urban and human settlements policy framework		
GOAL 12. ENSURE SUSTAINABLE CONSUMPTION AND PRODUCTION PATTERNS			
73	[Publication of resource-based contracts]- to be developed	EITI, UNCTAD, UN Global Compact	15, 16, 17
74	Global Food Loss Indicator [or other indicator to be developed to track the share of food lost or wasted in the value chain after harvest]	FAO	2, 11

75	Consumption of ozone-depleting substances (MDG Indicator)	UNEP Ozone Secretariat	9
76	Aerosol optical depth (AOD)	UNEP	9, 11, 13
77	[Share of companies valued at more than [\$1 billion] that publish integrated reporting] - to be developed	Global Compact, WBCSD, GRI, IIRC	8, 17
	Complementary National Indicators: 12.1. [Strategic environmental and social impact assessments required] - to be developed 12.2. [Legislative branch oversight role regarding resource-based contracts and licenses]-to be developed 12.3. [Indicator on chemical pollution] - to be developed 12.4. [CO2 intensity of the building sector and of new buildings (KgCO2/m2/year)] 12.5. [Indicator on policies for sustainable tourism] - to be developed		
GOAL 13. TAKE URGENT ACTION TO COMBAT CLIMATE CHANGE AND ITS IMPACTS			
78	Availability and implementation of a transparent and detailed deep decarbonization strategy, consistent with the 2°C - or below - global carbon budget, and with GHG emission targets for 2020, 2030 and 2050.	UNFCCC	9, 11, 12, 17
79	CO2 intensity of new power generation capacity installed (gCO2 per kWh), and of new cars (gCO2/pkm) and trucks (gCO2/tkm)	UNFCCC, IEA	7, 8, 9, 11
80	Net GHG emissions in the Agriculture, Forest and other Land Use (AFOLU) sector (tCO2e)	UNFCCC	2, 15
81	Official climate financing from developed countries that is incremental to ODA (in US\$)	OECD DAC, UNFCCC, IEA	17
	Complementary National Indicators: 13.1. [Climate Change Action Index] - to be developed 13.2. GHG emissions intensity of areas under forest management (GtCO2e / ha)		
GOAL 14. CONSERVE AND SUSTAINABLY USE THE OCEANS, SEAS AND MARINE RESOURCES FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT			
82	[Ocean Health Index]	Ocean Health Index Partnership	9, 12
83	Proportion of fish stocks within safe biological limits (MDG Indicator)	FAO	2, 12
	Complementary National Indicators: 14.1. Area of coral reef ecosystems and percentage live cover 14.2. [Indicator on the implementation of spatial planning strategies for coastal and marine areas]— to be developed 14.3. [Eutrophication of major estuaries] - to be developed 14.4. Share of coastal and marine areas that are protected 14.5. [Use of destructive fishing techniques] - to be developed 14.6. [Indicator on access to marine resources for small-scale artisanal fishers] - to be developed 14.7. [Indicator on transferring marine technology] - to be developed		

GOAL 15. PROTECT, RESTORE AND PROMOTE SUSTAINABLE USE OF TERRESTRIAL ECOSYSTEMS, SUSTAINABLY MANAGE FORESTS, COMBAT DESERTIFICATION, AND HALT AND REVERSE LAND DEGRADATION AND HALT BIODIVERSITY LOSS			
84	Annual change in forest area and land under cultivation (modified MDG Indicator)	FAO, UNEP	2, 12, 13
85	Area of forest under sustainable forest management as a percent of forest area	FAO, UNEP	12
86	Red List Index	IUCN	
87	Protected areas overlay with biodiversity	UNEP-WCMC	
	Complementary National Indicators: 15.1. Improved land ownership and governance of forests 15.2. [Indicator on the conservation of mountain ecosystems] - to be developed 15.3. Vitality Index of Traditional Environmental Knowledge 15.4. [Indicator on access to genetic resources] - to be developed 15.5. Abundance of invasive alien species 15.6. [Indicator on financial resources for biodiversity and ecosystems] - to be developed 15.7. [Indicator on financial resources for sustainable forest management] - to be developed 15.8. [Indicator on global support to combat poaching and trafficking of protected species] - to be developed 15.9. Living Planet Index		
GOAL 16. PROMOTE PEACEFUL AND INCLUSIVE SOCIETIES FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT, PROVIDE ACCESS TO JUSTICE FOR ALL AND BUILD EFFECTIVE, ACCOUNTABLE AND INCLUSIVE INSTITUTIONS AT ALL LEVELS			
88	Violent injuries and deaths per 100,000 population	UNODC, WHO, UNOCHA	3, 5, 11
89	Refugees and internal displacement caused by conflict and violence	UNHCR, OCHA	3
90	Assets and liabilities of BIS reporting banks in international tax havens (as per OECD definition), by country (US\$)	OECD	17
91	[Publication of all payments made to governments under resource contracts]-to be developed	UN Global Compact, EITI, and/or UNCTAD	17
92	Percentage of children under age 5 whose birth is registered with a civil authority	UNICEF	3, 5, 10
93	Existence and implementation of a national law and/or constitutional guarantee on the right to information	UNESCO	10
94	Perception of public sector corruption	Transparency International	
	Complementary National Indicators: 16.1. Percentage of women and men who report feeling safe walking alone at night in the city or area where they live		

	<p>16.2. Compliance with recommendations from the Universal Periodic Review and UN Treaties</p> <p>16.3. Number of children out of school in conflict- or disaster-affected countries</p> <p>16.4. [Indicator on security sector reform] - to be developed</p> <p>16.5. Frequency of payment of salaries within security forces</p> <p>16.6. [Compliance with OECD or other applicable Anti-Bribery Convention] - to be developed</p> <p>16.7. [Indicator on illicit financial flows] - to be developed</p> <p>16.8. [Indicator on international cooperation in preventing violence and combating terrorism and crime] – to be developed</p> <p>16.9. Percent of UN Emergency Appeals delivered</p> <p>16.10. Number of journalists and associated media personnel that are physically attacked, unlawfully detained or killed as a result of pursuing their legitimate activities.</p>		
GOAL 17. STRENGTHEN THE MEANS OF IMPLEMENTATION AND REVITALIZE THE GLOBAL PARTNERSHIP FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT			
95	Annual report by Bank for International Settlements (BIS), International Accounting Standards Board (IASB), International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS), International Monetary Fund (IMF), World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO), World Trade Organization (WTO) [other organizations to be added] on relationship between international rules and the SDGs and the implementation of relevant SDG targets	BIS, IASB, IFRS, IMF, WIPO, WTO	2, 10
96	Official development assistance (ODA) and net private grants as percent of high-income country's GNI	OECD, IMF	10
97	Domestic revenues allocated to sustainable development as percent of GNI	IMF	10
98	Private net flows for sustainable development at market rates as share of high-income country GNI	OECD DAC	10
99	Share of SDG Indicators that are reported annually	UNSD, OECD World Bank	10, 11
100	Evaluative Wellbeing and Positive Mood Affect	SDSN, OECD	3
	<p>Complementary National Indicators:</p> <p>17.1. Total Official Support for Development</p> <p>17.2. [Indicator on debt sustainability] - to be developed</p> <p>17.3. Gross domestic expenditure on R&D as share of GDP</p> <p>17.4. [Indicator on technology sharing and diffusion] - to be developed</p> <p>17.5. [Indicator on the creation of / subscription to the Technology Bank and STI (Science, Technology and Innovation) Capacity Building Mechanism for LDCs by 2017] - to be developed</p> <p>17.6. Average tariffs imposed by developed countries on agricultural products and textiles and clothing from developing countries (MDG Indicator)</p> <p>17.7. Value of LDC exports as a percentage of global exports</p> <p>17.8. [Indicator on investment promotion regimes for LDCs] - to be developed</p> <p>17.9. Percent of official development assistance (ODA), net private grants, and official climate finance channelled through priority pooled multilateral financing mechanisms</p>		

SECRETARY GENERAL'S SYNTHESIS REPORT

EXTRACTS ON JUSTICE

The advanced version of the Secretary General's (SG) synthesis report on was released on 4 December 2014.¹ It proposes an integrated set of **six essential elements: dignity, people, prosperity, planet, justice, and partnership**. The report explains the purpose of these elements:

[66] The following six essential elements would help frame and reinforce the universal, integrated and transformative nature of a sustainable development agenda and ensure that the ambition expressed by Member States in the report of the Open Working Group translates, communicates and is delivered at the country level (...)

In relation to element of justice, the Synthesis report states:

Justice: to promote safe and peaceful societies and strong institutions

[77] Effective governance for sustainable development demands that public institutions in all countries and at all levels be inclusive, participatory, and accountable to the people. Laws and institutions must protect human rights and fundamental freedoms. All must be free from fear and violence, without discrimination. We also know that participatory democracy, free, safe, and peaceful societies are both enablers and outcomes of development.

[78] Access to fair justice systems, accountable institutions of democratic governance, measures to combat corruption and curb illicit financial flows, and safeguards to protect personal security are integral to sustainable development. An enabling environment under the rule of law must be secured for the free, active and meaningful engagement of civil society and advocates reflecting the voices of women, minorities, LGBT groups, indigenous peoples, youth, adolescents and older persons. Press freedom and access to information, freedom of expression, assembly and association are enablers of sustainable development. The practice of child, early and forced marriage must be ended everywhere. The rule of law must be strengthened at the national and international level, to secure justice for all.

[79] We need to rebuild and reintegrate societies better after crises and conflicts. We must address state fragility, support internally displaced persons and contribute to resilience of people and communities. Reconciliation, peacebuilding and state-building are critical for countries to overcome fragility and develop cohesive societies, and strong institutions. These investments are essential to retaining the gains of development and avoiding reversals in the future.¹⁵

¹⁵ Synthesis report of the Secretary-General on the post-2015 sustainable development agenda, A/69/700, 4 Dec 2014, 23-24.

ANNEX C: THE HOST ORGANISATIONS

Advocates for International Development (A4ID)

A4ID is a global charity that believes the law can, and should, be used more effectively to eradicate global poverty. We draw together the legal, academic and development communities. By turning strong legal minds to the question of international development, we provide a powerful tool for groups seeking to secure the Millennium Development Goals worldwide.



Through our innovative broker service we bring together legal experts and those working towards the Millennium Development Goals, ensuring all those who need legal advice can access it. We help development organisations to understand what their legal needs are and then put them in touch with the legal experts who can assist. We have a network of more than 39,000 lawyers around the world who provide free legal advice to development organisations, civil society groups, bar associations, developing country governments and social enterprises.

We also play a strategic role in creating sustainable solutions to eradicating global poverty. We do this by working in partnership with lawyers and development organisations to raise awareness about the role law can play in tackling poverty, enable them to share best practice and learning, and inspire them to develop innovative development projects by harnessing the power of the law

A4ID is a registered charity in England & Wales (Charity no 1118565).

The Bingham Centre for the Rule of Law

The Bingham Centre was launched in December 2010. The Centre is named after Lord Bingham of Cornhill KG, the pre-eminent judge of his generation and a passionate advocate of the rule of law. The Bingham Centre for the Rule of Law is an independent research institute devoted to the study and promotion of the rule of law worldwide. It is distinguished in the UK and internationally by its specific focus on the rule of law. Its focus is on understanding and promoting the rule of law; considering the challenges it faces; providing an intellectual framework within which it can operate; and fashioning the practical tools to support it. Email: binghamcentre@biicl.org. Web: www.binghamcentre.biicl.org



The Bingham Centre is a constituent part of the British Institute for International and Comparative Law (BIICL) (Registered Charity No 209425, Company Registration 615025), a leading independent research organisation founded over fifty years ago. www.biicl.org



