



House of Commons
Science and Technology
Committee

Formal Minutes

Session 2009-10

The Science and Technology Committee

The Science and Technology Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration and policy of the Government Office for Science.

Current membership

Mr Phil Willis (*Liberal Democrat, Harrogate and Knaresborough*)(Chairman)
Dr Roberta Blackman-Woods (*Labour, City of Durham*)
Mr Tim Boswell (*Conservative, Daventry*)
Mr Ian Cawsey (*Labour, Brigg & Goole*)
Mrs Nadine Dorries (*Conservative, Mid Bedfordshire*)
Dr Evan Harris (*Liberal Democrat, Oxford West & Abingdon*)
Dr Brian Iddon (*Labour, Bolton South East*)
Mr Gordon Marsden (*Labour, Blackpool South*)
Dr Doug Naysmith (*Labour, Bristol North West*) [Added 18 January 2010]
Dr Bob Spink (*Independent, Castle Point*)
Ian Stewart (*Labour, Eccles*)
Graham Stringer (*Labour, Manchester, Blackley*)
Dr Desmond Turner (*Labour, Brighton Kemptown*)
Mr Rob Wilson (*Conservative, Reading East*)

Powers

The Committee is one of the departmental Select Committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No.152. These are available on the Internet via www.parliament.uk

Publications

The Reports and evidence of the Committee are published by The Stationery Office by Order of the House. All publications of the Committee (including press notices) are on the Internet at <http://www.parliament.uk/science>

Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are: Glenn McKee (Clerk); Richard Ward (Second Clerk); Dr Christopher Tyler (Committee Specialist); Xameerah Malik (Committee Specialist); Andy Boyd (Senior Committee Assistant); Camilla Brace (Committee Assistant); Dilys Tonge (Committee Assistant); Melanie Lee (Committee Assistant); Jim Hudson (Committee Support Assistant); and Becky Jones (Media Officer).

Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Science and Technology Committee, Committee Office, 7 Millbank, London SW1P 3JA. The telephone number for general inquiries is: 020 7219 2793; the Committee's e-mail address is: scitechcom@parliament.uk.

Proceedings of the Science and Technology Committee

Wednesday 18 November 2009

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon
Graham Stringer

1. The dismissal of Professor Nutt as Chairman of the Advisory Council on the Misuse of Drugs

The Committee considered this matter.

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *the dismissal of Professor Nutt as Chairman of the Advisory Council on the Misuse of Drugs* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Letters to the Chairman from Alan Johnson MP, Home Secretary, Professor Nutt, Professor Beddington, Government Chief Scientific Adviser and Professor Wiles, Chief Scientific Adviser at the Home Office.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 25 November at 9.00am.]

Wednesday 25 November 2009

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon

Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. Review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government

The Committee considered this matter.

Resolved to issue a call for written submissions on the principles that should apply to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government.

2. Future programme

The Committee considered this matter.

3. General purpose sub-committee

The Committee considered this matter.

4. Evidence Check

Ordered, That the following Memorandum relating to *Evidence Check* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Evidence Check: Government responses to questions from the Innovation, Universities, Science and Skills Committee [EC batch 2].

5. Evidence Check: Literacy Interventions

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *Evidence Check: Literacy Interventions* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Davis Learning Foundation, National Union of Teachers, Economic and Social Research Council, Bonita Thomson, Dr. Simon Gibbs, Association of Teachers and Lecturers, Dyslexia Action, Dr. Gordon Rugg and Sue Gerrard, Jennifer Chew (and one supplementary), Michael Lea, Geraldine Carter, Elizabeth Nonweiler, Diane McGuinness, Every Child a Chance Trust (and one supplementary), Ruth Allen, Bella Hewes, Dr. Morag Stuart, Dr. Jackie Masterson, Dr. Julie Dockrell and Dr. Yvonne Griffiths, Professor Usha Goswami, Uta Frith, Julia Douetil, Centre for Reading and Language, Department of Psychology, University of York, Dr. Kim S. H. Rochelle, Dr. Ian Smythe, Fionna Pilgrim, Sara Kramer, Department for Children, Schools and Families (and one supplementary), Dr. Susan Burroughs Lange, Professor Roger Beard, Derrie Clark, NAHT Special Educational Needs Sector Committee, INDIGO (Foundation) Norfolk, Professor Robert Slavin, Professor Julian Elliott, Yvonne Meyer, Dr. Chris Singleton and Elmhurst Primary School [LI 01-36].

6. Evidence Check: Homeopathy

The Committee considered this matter.

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *Evidence Check: Homeopathy* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Dental Practitioners Association, Professor David Colquhoun, John Boulderstone, Dr. Lionel R Milgrom, Katherine Boulderstone, Andrew Sikorski, UK Advisory Committee on Malaria Prevention in UK, Cyril W. Smith, Northern Ireland Association of Homeopaths, Les Rose, Dr. Andy Lewis, British Homeopathic Association, Jean Kinchen, Professor Lewith and Professor

Walach, Professor Katherine Thomas, Professor Edzard Ernst, Anne Waters, European Committee for Homeopathy, Professor Vincent Marks, Dr Joan Monro and Dr Peter Julu (and one supplementary), Dr. Peter Fisher, Dr. Sara Eames, Society of Homeopaths, Complementary Medicine Research Group, Francis Treuherz, Homeopathy Research Institute, Alliance of Registered Homeopaths, Arthritis Research Group, Dr Hugh Nielsen, British Association of Homeopathic Manufacturers, Liga Medicorum Homoeopathica Internationalis, Dr. Clare Relton, Homeopathy: Medicine for 21st Century, Department of Health, European Central Council of Homeopaths, Sense About Science, Royal Pharmaceutical Society, Judith Ford, NHS West Kent, Dr. Ben Goldacre, Prince's Foundation for Integrated Health, Science Council, Jackie Rowe, Advertising Standards Authority and The National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE) [HO 01-45].

[Adjourned till Monday 30 November at 4.00pm.

Monday 30 November 2009

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon

Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. Evidence Check: Homeopathy

The Committee considered this matter.

2. Swine Flu

The Committee considered this matter.

3. University of East Anglia: Climatic Research Unit

The Committee considered this matter.

4. Review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government

The Committee considered this matter.

5. British Physics Olympiad

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 2 December at 9.00am.

Wednesday 2 December 2009

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Ian Cawsey
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon
Graham Stringer

1. Evidence Check: Homeopathy

The Committee considered this matter.

2. The work of the Committee in 2008–09

Draft Report (*The work of the Committee in 2008–09*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the First Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 103).

3. Review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government

Motion made and Question put, That the Committee immediately enquire into the circumstances surrounding the dismissal of Professor David Nutt, former Chair of the Advisory Council on the Misuse of Drugs, and into the state of the relationship between scientific advisers and government and take oral evidence from scientists and Government including from Professor Nutt and Alan Johnson MP, Home Secretary.—
(*Dr Evan Harris.*)

The Committee divided.

Ayes, 1

Noes, 2

Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon
Graham Stringer

Question accordingly negatived.

4. *The work of the UK Research Councils*

The Committee considered this matter.

Written evidence relating to *the work of the UK research councils* was ordered to be reported to the House for printing [RCUK 01-06].

[Adjourned till Wednesday 9 December at 9.00am.

Wednesday 9 December 2009

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell

Mr Ian Cawsey

Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon

Ian Stewart

Graham Stringer

1. *Research Councils UK*

The Committee considered this matter.

2. *Evidence Check: Early Literacy Interventions*

Draft Report (*Evidence Check 1: Early Literacy Interventions*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Second Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 44).

3. *The Government's review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government*

Draft Report (*The Government's review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Third Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 158).

4. *Bioengineering: visit to UCL and Imperial College on 15 December*

Resolved, That the Chairman, Mr Boswell and Dr Iddon have leave to visit UCL and Imperial College in a representative capacity for the purposes of the Committee's inquiry into Bioengineering.

5. University of East Anglia: Climatic Research Unit

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 6 January at 9.00am.

Tuesday 15 December

The Chairman, Mr Boswell, Dr Iddon, Richard Ward (Clerk) and the Committee Specialist visited UCL and Imperial College for the purposes of the Committee's inquiry into Bioengineering in a representative capacity, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 9 December.

Wednesday 6 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon

1. Bioengineering: visit to UCL and Imperial College on 15 December

The Committee considered this matter.

2. Publication of Report on Evidence Check 1: Early Literacy Interventions

The Committee considered this matter.

3. Publication of Report on the Government's review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government

The Committee considered this matter.

4. Forward programme

The Committee considered this matter.

5. Bioengineering

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *Bioengineering* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Department for Business, Innovation and Skills, the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, and the Department of Health, Peter Raymond MBE, The Science and Technology Studies Unit, University of York, Imperial College London, Professor Mike Ferguson, Egenis (ESRC Centre for Genomics in Society), University of Exeter, All Party Parliamentary Pro-Life Group, GeneWatch UK, Alistair Elfick, National Institute of Agricultural Botany, Society for General Microbiology, Northeast England Stem Cell Institute, School of Pharmacy & Biomolecular Sciences, Faculty of Science and Engineering, University of Brighton, UK National Stem Cell Network, Pfizer Limited, Technology Strategy Board, John Innes Centre, Human Tissue Authority, Royal Society of Edinburgh, Centre for Bioethics and Emerging Technologies, British Standards Institution, College of Science and Engineering, University of Edinburgh, Government Chemist, East of England Stem Cell Network, ESRC Innogen Centre, Parkinson's Disease Society, Royal Academy of Engineering, Syngenta, Scottish Centre for Innovation in Spinal Cord Injury, NHS Blood and Transplant, Agricultural Biotechnology Council, Professor Chris Mason, Future Health Technologies Ltd, Royal Society of Chemistry, Research Councils UK, The Wellcome Trust, and Office for Strategic Coordination of Health Research [Bio 00-36].

6. The Regulation of Geoengineering

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *The Regulation of Geoengineering* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: James Lee, British Geophysical Association, Alan Gadian, John Gorman, John Virgoe, Dr Adam Corner, Tim Kruger et al, Sustainability Council of New Zealand, ETC Group, UK Research Councils, and The Royal Society [Geo 01-11].

7. Evidence Check 2: Homeopathy

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *Evidence Check 2: Homeopathy* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Northern Ireland Association of Homeopaths supplementary, British Homeopathic Association supplementary, Professor Edzard Ernst supplementaries, Society of Homeopaths supplementary, Department of Health supplementary, The National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence supplementary, Parliamentary Group for Integrated and Complementary Healthcare, Irish Health Trade Association, Oliver Dowding, Maria Jevtics, Sue Young, J A Wheatley, Medicines and Healthcare products Regulatory Agency, Hugh Evans, British Medical Association, and Dr Vijay Vaishnav [HO 9a, 12a, 16a, 16b, 23a, 34a, 45a, and 46-56].

[Adjourned till Wednesday 13 January at 9.00am.]

Wednesday 13 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon
Graham Stringer

1. Government's review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government

The Committee considered this matter.

2. Forward programme

The Committee considered this matter.

Resolved, That the Committee inquire into the impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research.

3. Department for Business, Innovation and Skills Winter Supplementary Estimate 2009-10

The Committee considered this matter.

4. University of East Anglia: Climatic Research Unit

The Committee considered this matter.

5. The Regulation of Geoengineering

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *The Regulation of Geoengineering* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Dr Jason Blackstock and Department of Energy and Climate Change [Geo 12-13].

[Adjourned till Wednesday 20 January at 9.00am.]

Wednesday 20 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell

Dr Doug Naysmith

Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon

Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. Declaration of Interests

Dr Doug Naysmith had no interests to disclose, pursuant to the resolution of the House of 13 July 1992.

2. Membership of the Science and Technology Sub-Committee

Ordered, That Dr Doug Naysmith be appointed a member of the Sub-committee.

3. Forward programme

The Committee considered this matter.

Resolved, That the Committee inquire into the disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia.

4. The Royal Institution

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 27 January at 9.00am.]

Wednesday 27 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Ian Cawsey
Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon

Dr Doug Naysmith
Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. The Committee's Legacy Report

The Committee considered this matter.

2. The regulation of geoengineering

The Committee considered this matter.

3. The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia

The Committee considered this matter.

4. Forward Programme

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Monday 1 February at 4.00pm.]

Monday 1 February 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon

Dr Doug Naysmith
Ian Stewart

1. Bioengineering

The Committee considered this matter.

2. Evidence Check 2: Homeopathy

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 3 February at 9.00am.]

Wednesday 3 February 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon
Dr Doug Naysmith

Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research

The Committee considered this matter.

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research* be reported to the House for publication on the internet:

The Department of Health, Professor Andrew Wallard, Dr. Rob W. van Nues, Dr Sumedh Anathpindika, Martin Ward, Dr D Crouch, Professor Jon Billowes, Professor Leslie Ann Goldberg, Professor Phil Allport, Professor Julie Gray, Early Career Cassini Scientists, University College Union, Christopher Connolly, Royal Society/Royal Academy of Engineering Science Advisory Group for the National Physical Laboratory, TUV/NEL, Engineering Professors Council, Prospect, Lancaster University, Eric Clarke, University of Sussex, LHCb experiment CERN, Geneva, National Physical Laboratory, Head of School of Optometry, Wellcome Trust, Professor Sean J Freeman, Faculty of Mathematical and Physics Sciences, Royal Astronomical Society, Physics and Astronomy Department, University of Sheffield, UK Nuclear Research Groups, UK Space Academic Network, UK Cassini Project scientists, Research Councils UK, Professor Susan Cooper, British Geophysical Association, LGC, British Heart Foundation, The Royal Society of Chemistry, Professor David Clarke, Deputy Vice-Chancellor, University of Bristol, Todd Huffman, Professor P F Roche, SouthEast Physics Network, Cluster Early-Career Scientists, Juvenile Diabetes Research Foundation, UK Deans of Science, Professor Albert Zijlstra, The University of Leeds, STFC Science Board, Alzheimer's Research Trust, 1994 Group, UCL, Higher Education Funding Council for England, Alan Wood, Institute of Physics, Magnetosphere, Ionosphere and Solar-Terrestrial Council, John Barnden, Professor of Artificial Intelligence, BCS Academy of Computing, Oxford University, Cancer Research UK, The Academy of Medical Sciences, Motor Neurone Disease Association, William Gelletly, University of Leicester, and Department for Business, Innovation and Skills [FC 00-62 and 70].

[Adjourned till Monday 8 February at 4.00pm.

Monday 8 February 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Mr Ian Cawsey
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Doug Naysmith
Ian Stewart

1. Evidence Check 2: Homeopathy

Draft Report (*Evidence Check 2: Homeopathy*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Fourth Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 45).

[Adjourned till Wednesday 10 February at 9.00 am

Wednesday 10 February 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Doug Naysmith
Graham Stringer

1. Bioengineering

The Committee considered this matter.

2. *The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia*

The Committee considered this matter.

3. *Royal Society of Chemistry debate on Science and the General Election 2010*

The Committee considered this matter.

4. *Evidence Check 2: Homeopathy*

The Committee considered this matter.

5. *The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research*

The Committee considered this matter.

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Prospect supplementary, Loughborough University, Open University, ADS, million+, The Russell Group, Universities UK, University Alliance, Syngenta, Society of Biology, Jonathan Haskel, Professor Joao Magueijo, Professor Nancy Cartwright, Royal Geographical Society, Professor Gordon Davies, Association of Medical Research Charities, Dr Paul Craze, The Parkinson's Disease Society, Dr Marta Mazzocco, Dr Alexander Strohmaier and Professor Eugene Ferapontov, Professor Lee, University of Leicester, Professor Luc Bovens, Peter Merrill, Marco Ripani and Paul Stoler, Met Office, and Durham University [FC 16a, 63-69 and 71-87].

6. *The regulation of geoengineering*

The Committee considered this matter.

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *The regulation of geoengineering* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Tim Kruger *et al* supplementary

[Adjourned till Wednesday 24 February at 9.00am.

Wednesday 24 February 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Dr Evan Harris

Ian Stewart

Dr Brian Iddon

Graham Stringer

Dr Doug Naysmith

1. The Government's review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government

Draft Special Report (*The Government's review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government: Government Response to the Committee's Third Report of Session 2009–10*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up, read the first and second time, and agreed to.

The Government's response to the Third Report from the Science and Technology Committee was appended to the Report.

Resolved, That the Report be the First Special Report of the Committee to the House.

Ordered, That the Chairman make the Report to the House.

2. Evidence Check 1: Early Literacy Interventions

Draft Special Report (*Evidence Check 1: Early Literacy Interventions: Government Response to the Committee's Second Report of Session 2009–10*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up, read the first and second time, and agreed to.

The Government's response to the Second Report from the Science and Technology Committee was appended to the Report.

Resolved, That the Report be the Second Special Report of the Committee to the House.

Ordered, That the Chairman make the Report to the House.

3. Evidence Check 2: Homeopathy

The Committee considered this matter.

4. The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia

The Committee considered this matter.

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: University of East Anglia, Richard S Courtney, Edward Dilley, Stuart Huggett, Walter Radtke, G R Ryan, Geoffrey H Sherrington, Lalu Hanuman, John Wadsworth, Peter Sinclair, Ian Goddard, Steve McIntyre, Martin Brumby, Susan Ewens, Roger Helmer MEP, Stephen Prower, Eric Rasmusen, Phillip Bratby, Godfrey Bloom MEP, Clive Menzies, Dr Michael Simons, Aporia, David Shaw, Dr. D. R. Keiller, David Holland, Ronald K Bolton, Dr. Sonja Boehmer-Christiansen, The Global Warming Policy Foundation, Dr. Timothy J. Osborn, Professor Peter Cox, Mike Haseler, Professor Ross McKittrick, Stephen McIntyre supplementary, Steven Mosher, Professor Darrel Ince, Warwick Hughes, Andrew Montford, Richard Tyrwhitt-Drake and supplementary, Dr Benny Peiser, The Institute of Physics, David Andrew Cockroft, Anne Stallybrass, Royal Society of Chemistry, Professor Hans von Storch and Dr. Myles R. Allen, Research Councils UK, Public Interest Research Centre, Douglas J. Keenan, Royal Statistical Society, Climate Change E-Mail Review Team, Professor John Beddington, Peter Taylor, John F Kelly, Peabody Energy Company, Richard Thomas CBE, and Met Office [CRU 00-54].

5. Department for Business, Innovation and Skills' Autumn Performance Report

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Monday 1 March at 2.45pm.]

Monday 1 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell

Ian Stewart

Dr Evan Harris

Graham Stringer

Dr Doug Naysmith

1. The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia

The Committee considered this matter.

Ordered, That the following Memoranda relating to *The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: University of East Anglia supplementary and John Graham-Cunning [CRU 00a and 55].

[Adjourned till Wednesday 3 March at 9.00am.

Wednesday 3 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Dr Evan Harris

Ian Stewart

Dr Brian Iddon

Graham Stringer

Dr Doug Naysmith

1. The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research

The Committee considered this matter.

2. The Government's review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government

The Committee considered this matter.

3. The Legacy Report

The Committee considered this matter.

4. The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia

The Committee considered this matter.

5. Science Question Time

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 10 March at 9.00am.

Wednesday 10 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Ian Cawsey
Dr Brian Iddon

Dr Doug Naysmith
Graham Stringer

1. The Regulation of Geoengineering

Draft Report (*The Regulation of Geoengineering*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Fifth Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 221).

2. Science Question Time

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 17 March at 9.00am.

Wednesday 17 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon
Graham Stringer

1. The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research

Draft Report (*The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Sixth Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 335).

2. Bioengineering

The Committee considered this matter.

Draft Report (*Bioengineering*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Seventh Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 220).

3. Geoengineering: visit to the Institute for Manufacturing, Cambridge

Resolved, That the Chairman has leave to visit the Institute for Manufacturing in Cambridge in representative capacity for the purposes of the Committee's inquiry into the Regulation of Geoengineering.

[Adjourned till Monday 22 March at 4.00pm.

Thursday 18 March

The Chairman and the Committee Specialist visited the Institute for Manufacturing in Cambridge for the purposes of the Committee's inquiry into the Regulation of Geoengineering in a representative capacity, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 17 March.

Monday 22 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Dr Evan Harris

Ian Stewart

Dr Brian Iddon

Graham Stringer

Dr Doug Naysmith

1. The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 24 March at 9.00am.

Wednesday 24 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell

Dr Brian Iddon

Dr Evan Harris

Graham Stringer

1. The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia

Draft Report (*The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Eighth Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 387).

2. The Legacy Report

Draft Report (*The Legacy Report*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Ninth Report of the Committee, Session 2009–10, HC 481).

3. The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research

The Committee considered this matter.

Ordered, That the following Memorandum relating to *The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research* be reported to the House for publication on the internet: Department for Business, Innovation and Skills [Letter from Lord Drayson dated 22 March 2010].

[The Committee adjourned.]

Proceedings of the Science and Technology Sub-Committee

Wednesday 25 November 2009

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell

Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon

Ian Stewart

Graham Stringer

1. Evidence Check: Homeopathy

Professor Jayne Lawrence, Chief Scientific Adviser, Royal Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain, Robert Wilson, Chairman, British Association of Homeopathic Manufacturers, Paul Bennett, Professional Standards Director, Boots, Tracey Brown, Managing Director, Sense About Science and Dr. Ben Goldacre, Journalist; Dr. Peter Fisher, Director of Research, Royal London Homeopathic Hospital, Professor Edzard Ernst, Director, Complementary Medicine Group, Peninsula Medical School, Dr. James Thallon, Medical Director, NHS West Kent and Dr. Robert Mathie, Research Development Adviser, British Homeopathic Association gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Monday 30 November at 4.15pm.]

Monday 30 November 2009

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon

Ian Stewart

Graham Stringer

1. Evidence Check: Homeopathy

Rt Hon Mike O'Brien QC MP, Minister for Health Services, Department of Health, Professor David Harper CBE, Director General, Health Improvement and Protection, and Chief Scientist, Department of Health, and Professor Kent Woods, Chief Executive, Medicines and Healthcare Products Regulatory Agency, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 2 December at 10.00am.]

Wednesday 2 December 2009

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Ian Cawsey
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon
Graham Stringer

1. The work of the UK research councils

Professor Alan Thorpe, Chairman of Research Councils UK and Chief Executive of the Natural Environment Research Council, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 6 January 2009 at 9.30am.]

Wednesday 6 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon

1. Bioengineering

Professor Douglas Kell, Chief Executive, Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (on behalf of Research Councils UK), Professor Richard Kitney OBE FReng, Co-Director, Centre for Synthetic Biology and Innovation, Imperial College, London, and Professor Sir Martin Evans, Professor of Mammalian Genetics, Cardiff University; Dr. Ray Elliott, Head of Strategic Projects, Syngenta and Professor Chris Mason, Chair of Regenerative Medicine Bioprocessing, University College London, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 13 January 2010 at 9.30am.]

Wednesday 13 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Mr Ian Cawsey

Dr Brian Iddon
Graham Stringer

1. The Regulation of Geoengineering

Dr Jason J Blackstock, Centre for International Governance Innovation, Canada, Professor David Keith, Director, ISEEE Energy and Environmental Systems Group, University of Calgary, and John Virgoe, expert in geoengineering governance [all via video link]; Sir David King, Director of the Smith School of Enterprise and the Environment and former Government Chief Scientific Adviser, and Dr Maarten van Aalst, Associate Director and Lead Climate Specialist at the Red Cross/Red Crescent Climate Centre; Joan Ruddock MP, Minister of State, Department of Energy and Climate Change, Professor David MacKay, Chief Scientific Adviser, Department of Energy and Climate Change, and Professor Nick Pidgeon, on behalf of Research Councils UK, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 20 January 2010 at 9.30am.]

Wednesday 20 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon

Dr Doug Naysmith
Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. Bioengineering

Professor Lisa Jardine CBE, Chair, Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority, Dr Paul Logan, Head of Policy, Hazardous Installations Directorate, Health and Safety Executive, Professor Chris Pollock CBE, Honorary Professor, University of Aberystwyth, and Dr Martyn Ward, Head, Clinical Trials Unit, Medicines and Healthcare products Regulatory Agency, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 27 January 2010 at 10.15am.]

Wednesday 27 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Ian Cawsey
Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon

Dr Doug Naysmith
Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. Bioengineering

Lord Drayson, Minister for Science and Innovation, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills, Dan Norris MP, Minister for Rural Affairs and Environment, Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, and Dr Mark Bale, Deputy Director of Health, Science and Bioethics, Department of Health, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 3 February at 9.30am.]

Wednesday 3 February 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell

Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brian Iddon

Dr Doug Naysmith

Ian Stewart

Graham Stringer

1. The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research

Lord Broers, Professor Brian Cox, School of Physics and Astronomy, University of Manchester, Nick Dusic, Director, Campaign for Science and Engineering, and Sir Peter Williams, Vice-President, The Royal Society; Iain Gray, Chief Executive, Technology Strategy Board, Dr Tony Peatfield, Director of Corporate Affairs, Medical Research Council, Professor Michael Sterling, Chair, Science and Technology Facilities Council, and Professor Alan Thorpe, Chair, Research Councils UK, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 10 February at 9.30am.]

Wednesday 10 February 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell

Dr Evan Harris

Dr Doug Naysmith

Graham Stringer

1. The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research

Professor Michael Arthur, Chair, The Russell Group, Professor Janet Beer, Chair, University Alliance, Professor Les Ebdon, Chair, million+, and Professor Paul Wellings, Chair, The 1994 Group; Dr Alastair Hunter, President, University and College Union,

Sir Alan Langlands, Chief Executive, Higher Education Funding Council for England, Professor Adrian Smith, Director General, Science and Research, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills, and Professor Steve Smith, President, Universities UK, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 24 February at 9.30am.

Wednesday 24 February 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris
Dr Brian Iddon

Dr Doug Naysmith
Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. The impact of spending cuts on science and scientific research

The Rt Hon Lord Drayson, Minister for Science and Innovation, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills and The Rt Hon David Lammy MP, Minister of State for Higher Education and Intellectual Property, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills, gave oral evidence.

2. The Government's review of the principles applying to the treatment of independent scientific advice provided to government

The Rt Hon Lord Drayson, Minister for Science and Innovation, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills and Professor John Beddington, Government Chief Scientific Adviser, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Monday 1 March at 3.00pm.

Monday 1 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris
Dr Doug Naysmith

Ian Stewart
Graham Stringer

1. The disclosure of climate data from the Climatic Research Unit at the University of East Anglia

The Rt Hon the Lord Lawson of Blaby, Chairman, and Dr Benny Peiser, Director, Global Warming Policy Foundation; Richard Thomas CBE, former Information Commissioner; Professor Edward Acton, Vice-Chancellor, University of East Anglia and Professor Phil Jones, Director of the Climatic Research Unit; Sir Muir Russell, Head of the Independent Climate Change E-Mails Review; Professor John Beddington, Government Chief Scientific Adviser, Professor Julia Slingo OBE, Chief Scientist, Met Office, and Professor Bob Watson, Chief Scientist, Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 24 March at 10.00am.

Wednesday 24 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Phil Willis, in the Chair

Mr Tim Boswell
Dr Evan Harris

Dr Brain Iddon
Graham Stringer

1. Science Question Time

The Rt Hon Lord Drayson, Minister for Science and Innovation, Department for Business, Innovation and Skills, gave oral evidence.

[The Sub-Committee adjourned.